

*Editors* **Francisco Aldecoa and Michael Keating**

---



# **Paradiplomacy in Action**

**The Foreign Relations of  
Subnational Governments**

---

## PARADIPLOMACY IN ACTION

THE CASS SERIES IN REGIONAL AND FEDERAL STUDIES

ISSN 1363-5670

*General Editor: John Loughlin*

---

This series brings together some of the foremost academics and theorists to examine the timely subject of regional and federal issues, which since the mid-1980s have become key questions in political analysis and practice.

The Political Economy of Regionalism

*edited by Michael Keating and John Loughlin*

The Regional Dimension of the European Union: Towards a Third Level in Europe? *edited by Charlie Jeffery*

Remaking the Union: Devolution and British Politics in the 1990s

*edited by Howard Elcock and Michael Keating*

Paradiplomacy in Action: The Foreign Relations of Subnational Governments

*edited by Francisco Aldecoa and Michael Keating*

**PARADIPLOMACY IN ACTION**  
**The Foreign Relations of**  
**Subnational Governments**

*Editors*

FRANCISCO ALDECOA  
MICHAEL KEATING

 **Routledge**  
Taylor & Francis Group  
LONDON AND NEW YORK

*First published in 1999 in Great Britain and in the United States of America by*  
FRANK CASS PUBLISHERS

Published 2013 by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN  
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017 USA

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

Copyright © 1999 Taylor & Francis

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Paradiplomacy in action : the foreign relations of  
subnational governments. – (The Cass series in regional and  
federal studies; v. 4)

I. Administrative and political divisions 2. Diplomacy  
3. International relations 4. Negotiation - International  
cooperation 5. Central-local government relations  
I. Aldecoa, Francesco II. Keating, Michael, 1950-  
320.8

ISBN 978 0 7146 4971 9 (cloth)  
ISBN 978 0 7146 8018 7 (paper)  
ISBN 978 1 3150 3949 7 (eISBN)  
ISSN 1363-5670

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data:

Paradiplomacy in action : the foreign relations of subnational  
governments / edited by Francisco Aldecoa and Michael Keating.  
p. cm. – (The Cass series in regional and federal studies,  
ISSN 1363-5670: 4)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7146-4971-9 (cloth). – ISBN 978-0-7146-8018-7 (pbk.). –  
ISBN 978-1-3150-3949-7 (eISBN).

I. Subnational governments- Foreign relations. I. Aldecoa,  
Francisco. II. Keating, Michael, 1950-. III. Series.

JZ4059.P37 1999  
327.1-dc21

99-20579  
CIP

This group of studies first appeared in a special issue of *Regional & Federal Studies*  
(ISSN 1359-7566) Vol.9, No.1 (Spring, 1999)  
published by Frank Cass and Co. Ltd.

*All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a  
retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical,  
photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher  
of this book.*

# Contents

Introduction	vii
Regions and International Affairs: Motives, Opportunities and Strategies <i>Michael Keating</i>	1
Patrolling the 'Frontier': Globalization, Localization and the 'Actorness' of Non-Central Governments <i>Brian Hocking</i>	17
Diplomacy and Paradiplomacy in the Redefinition of International Security: Dimensions of Conflict and Co-operation <i>Noé Cornago</i>	40
The European Union and Inter-regional Co-operation <i>Kepa Sodupe</i>	58
Towards Plurinational Diplomacy in the Deeper and Wider European Union (1985–2005) <i>Francisco Aldecoa</i>	82
The Other Dimension of Third Level Politics in Europe: The Congress of Local and Regional Powers of the Council of Europe <i>Jose Luis de Castro</i>	95
The International Competence of US States and their Local Governments <i>John Kincaid</i>	111
Federal–State Relations in Australian External Affairs: A New Co-operative Era? <i>John Ravenhill</i>	134
The Quebec Experience: Success or Failure? <i>Louis Balthazar</i>	153
The International Relations of Basque Nationalism and the First Basque Autonomous Government (1890–1939) <i>Alexander Ugalde</i>	170
Making Sense of Paradiplomacy? An Intertextual Inquiry about a Concept in Search of a Definition <i>Iñaki Aguirre</i>	185
Abstracts	210
Notes on Contributors	215
Index	219

*Page Intentionally Left Blank*

# Introduction

FRANCISCO ALDECOA AND  
MICHAEL KEATING

The international activities of regions have attracted considerable political and scholarly attention in recent years. This has perhaps been most notable in Europe, where the protagonism of regions within the EU and the alliances among regions have generated a substantial literature, but the phenomenon has also marked federal states such as the USA, Australia and Canada. The motives, strategies and resources of substate governments in the international arena differ considerably, as the contributions to this volume show. So do the responses of sovereign states to what many of them still regard as an intrusion into their exclusive domain.

This activity is not new, as several of the contributions show, yet its resurgence in the late twentieth century is normally attributed to the effects of globalization and the rise of continental trading regimes such as the European Union (EU) and the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA). These have served to erode the old distinction between domestic and international affairs and focused attention on the need for regions and cities to position themselves for global competition. From this perspective, there is a strong functional logic in regions' external projection, which is related to economic needs, to the spillover of their domestic competences into the international arena and in some cases to the need to manage ethnic or nationalist conflicts at their borders, with the security issues that these pose. Yet functionalism itself does not explain everything and we need to add political explanations derived from the goals and strategies of substate elites, building or promoting their region or, in some cases, preparing the way for national independence.

Responses on the part of national states also differ. In general it would be reasonable to say that states do not welcome the intrusion of substate actors into an area which is traditionally their reserved domain. Some see any external representation of regions as a threat to national sovereignty and integrity. On the other hand, state foreign policy has itself been transformed away from classical diplomacy and foreign ministries have themselves lost their monopoly of external action as large areas of domestic policy have been internationalized. States are therefore learning to live with a new dispensation in which they share roles with their regions and need to co-operate abroad. In some cases, matters are more sensitive than others, and a variety of patterns of conflict and co-operation emerge from the contributions.



There are sharp differences in the interpretation of these activities. Does this activity represent a new paradigm for international relations, in which state borders are penetrated by a multiplicity of actors and the old models of interstate relations are challenged? Does it force us to reconsider the traditional distinction between international relations and comparative politics? Several of the contributions address this issue, seeking to distinguish a field of 'paradiplomacy' carried out by non-state actors and to be distinguished from the classical diplomacy of states. This is itself controversial. Aguirre, in the final chapter, expresses considerable reservations about the term, and others have complained of its vagueness or asked whether it represents a coherent field of activity. We are aware of this problem and have adopted the term in our title as an indication of the general field, while leaving authors free to use, interpret or criticize it as they see fit. A similar problem concerns the actors involved, which include regions, cities, stateless nations and ethnic groups and a variety of sectoral and political interests. Again, we have striven for a broad and open approach, going for the term 'subnational' to refer to public authorities at the regional level, below the sovereign state, in the full knowledge that many of these regard themselves as national, if not fully sovereign actors. Most of the contributions deal with the activities of governments at this level and this, rather than the work of social movements and non-governmental organizations, is the focus of the project, although again we do not rule out the latter where they come into the picture.

It was to discuss these issues and to compare the experiences of regions in various parts of the world that we launched this project, with a seminar in Bilbao in September 1997. What emerged is a phenomenon of growing importance in a wide variety of settings. Michael Keating starts with a discussion of the motives, opportunities and strategies of regions in going international, placing the phenomenon in the context of globalization, free trade and the interpenetration of domestic and international spheres of action. Brian Hocking considers the ways in which non-central governments (NCGs) can constitute themselves as actors in the international arena alongside states, warning against the easy tendency to assimilate them to conventional international actors, whether states or corporations. Noé Cornago offers a wide-ranging review of the role of paradiplomacy in the redefinition of national security, notably in the field of ethnic conflict, citing examples from Europe, Asia, the former Soviet Union and the Americas. European integration further erodes the distinction between internal and external policy and creates a new set of institutions and policy arenas at the continental level which have drawn massive attention from subnational governments of all types.

The next three chapters examine paradiplomacy in Europe. Kepa

Sodupe looks at the way in which the European Union promotes and manages inter-regional co-operation through its policies and programmes. Francisco Aldecoa presents the case for plurinational diplomacy as a means for managing nationality conflicts in multinational states, themselves embedded in the European Union. This involves a surrender by the state of its monopoly in defining the national interest and carrying it through but also a recognition on the part of national minorities of their membership in the state. José Luis de Castro goes beyond the European Union to look at the role of the Council of Europe and its Congress of Local and Regional Powers of Europe and assesses its role in promoting regional co-operation and representation.

Paradiplomacy has always been a sensitive issue in federal states, where the division of powers, giving exclusive external competence to the federation, often clashes with the desire on the part of the federated units to project their domestic responsibilities abroad. The next three chapters examine this phenomenon in non-European cases. John Kincaid reviews the history and experience of international action by US states, showing how this is rooted in early constitutional practice and has been revived and expanded in an era of globalization. John Ravenhill covers the case of Australia, tracing the evolution from conflict to a more co-operative relationship. The case of Quebec is particularly sensitive since Quebec governments have long sought an external presence not merely for functional purposes but as a recognition of their national personality. This has come into conflict with Canadian policy as Canada, emerging from the British connection, has sought to constitute itself as a nation and to reserve the right of representation abroad. Louis Balthazar discusses the conflicts and difficulties to which this has given rise.

Alexander Ugalde presents a historical case, that of the Basque nationalist movement in its early years and during the period of Basque self-government under the Second Republic, highlighting the strategies, links and institutions used by the Basques to project themselves abroad. This reminds us that the phenomenon of paradiplomacy is not new and provides material for comparison with the strategies of national minorities in contemporary Europe.

Concluding the collection, Iñaki Aguirre questions the evolution of the 'paradiplomacy' paradigm, asking whether this adequately captures the phenomenon we are currently witnessing. Rather than seeking to extend the concept of diplomacy, he suggests, we might better think about a 'postdiplomatic' world, truly recognizing the new and complex realities.

While there is no common conclusion to the collection, some themes recur throughout the volume. First is the recognition that subnational involvement in external affairs is not a matter of transient fashion but does

represent a change in the practice of diplomacy. Second, this will give rise to conflicts with states and to rivalries among regions within them. Third, these conflicts are not necessarily intractable, and the external roles of states and regions are not necessarily incompatible. Rather there are multiple opportunities for co-operation and shared roles. Fourth, this requires some change in attitude on the part of states and regions, to accept the new realities of shared powers and interdependence. Practices in this field are changing and evolving and there is a learning process involved.

We are grateful to the University of the Basque Country for financial support of our 1997 seminar and to the participants for their commentaries and criticisms.

# **Regions and International Affairs: Motives, Opportunities and Strategies**

MICHAEL KEATING

## THE RISE OF PARADIPLOMACY

Recent years have seen an increasing involvement of regional governments in the international arena (Duchacek *et al.*, 1988; Hocking, 1997), a phenomenon sometimes known as paradiplomacy. The reasons lie both in changes at the level of the state and international system, and in political and economic developments within regions themselves. Globalization and the rise of transnational regimes, especially regional trading areas, have eroded the distinction between domestic and foreign affairs and by the same token have transformed the division of responsibilities between state and subnational governments. Globalization itself has economic, cultural and political dimensions. Free movement of capital and the rise of the multinational corporation have eroded the ability of states to manage national economies, and have indeed made it ever more difficult to talk of national economies at all. Modern communications technology and the dominance of a global culture originating largely in the United States have eroded national cultures and the role of states in promoting and protecting them. The consequent loss of autonomy and capacity on the part of states has given rise to speculation about the end of sovereignty (Camilleri and Falk, 1992) as understood in the last 200 years or so.<sup>1</sup> Transnational regimes<sup>2</sup> have arisen in defence (NATO), in trade (NAFTA and the European Union), and in human rights (European Convention on Human Rights) and in Europe there is a project for building a political union above the sovereign states. Many of these provisions impinge on issues that are the responsibility of subnational governments or have a particular incidence in specific territories, drawing regions into the international arena.

At the same time, there has been a restructuring of territorial politics within states, with the rise of new actors and issues. Functional restructuring is in some respects eroding the importance of territory. Globalization of the economy, mobility of capital and communications and transportation technology have severed many of the links between place and production, allowing a freer choice of location and reducing the dependence of firms on the proximity of raw materials or waterways. The new communications media may erode the

connection between culture and territory, by importing global culture, as well as by making it possible for cultural communities to exist without physical proximity. Politics too can be detached from territory, as transnational social and political movements or groups defined by ethnicity or gender compete with traditional forms of mobilization. Some observers have taken this so far as to talk of the 'end of territory' (Badie, 1995). Yet this is only part of the story, since there has also been a reinvention of territory as a functional requirement and as a political principle, within the new global order (Keating, 1998). Functionally, the most important effects are in economic and cultural matters. In the face of global change, the importance of territory as an ingredient in economic restructuring is now widely recognized (Storper, 1995; Amin and Thrift, 1994; Dunford and Kafkalas, 1992). The impact of global forces is mediated by the characteristics of specific territories, while the successful insertion of regions into the global economy depends very much on their capacity to engage in social co-operation and produce public goods. In a revival of the old idea of industrial districts, the qualities of specific places are now seen to be key factors in competitiveness, while the old idea of comparative advantage, according to which each region found its place in the global division of labour, has given way to the idea of competitive advantage, in which absolute advantages accrue to regions with the appropriate characteristics (Storper, 1995). This inter-regional competition is partly imposed by functional changes in the global economy; but it is partly the invention of political entrepreneurs who use the theme to consolidate their own regions and enhance their political standing within them. Regions are thus pitched into a neo-mercantilist competition for advantage in global and continental markets. Culture may also be globalizing in some respects, but local and minority cultures are also reviving, and territory is seen increasingly as the basis on which to protect and develop them.

To these functional reasons are added political impulses to re-territorialization. The weakening of the nation-state in the face of global pressures has enhanced the importance of territorial fault lines within multinational states such as Canada, Spain, Belgium or the United Kingdom. New forms of nationalism have emerged, less tied to the construction of a state in the classic sense, and more concerned with building a capacity for collective action, in government and civil society, in the face of the global market (Keating, 1997). In other places, we see a new regionalism (Keating, 1998) defined by its global and market context, or the rise of cities as actors. Development coalitions have emerged in these territorial spaces, seeking to manage the insertion of their territories into the global market, while controlling the socially disintegrative effects of that market. Territory thus becomes a key factor in the relationship between society and the global market and in the constitution of arenas for political debate and systems of collective action. Regionalism and minority

nationalism, often associated in the past with protectionism, are now as likely to be committed strongly to free trade and especially in Europe, to continental integration, seeing this as a new space within which to develop and project their social and economic programmes.

An important factor in this is the decline of the state's capacity for territorial management, and the undermining of the exchange relationship in which states delivered protection from the market and favourable spending policies, in exchange either for loyalty to the state (in multinational states) or support for the government in power. In the nineteenth century, the state's contribution to the exchange usually comprised trade and tariff policies, which could be adjusted to the needs and demands of various regions as well as sectors and social groups. In the twentieth century, the high point of territorial exchange was represented by the regional policies of the 1960s and 1970s, presented as a non-zero-sum arrangement whereby developing or declining regions could benefit from the diversion of investment their way, booming regions could benefit from the relief of congestion and the national economy could gain from the use of idle resources in the periphery. Tariff policies are now limited by global and continental trading regimes. Diversionary regional policies are also limited by international trading rules (especially in Europe) and are of decreasing effectiveness in a global economy where firms can choose to locate outside the state boundaries altogether if they do not get their preferred location. National governments have accordingly put more emphasis on national competitiveness and less on regional balance, leaving sub-state governments to fill the gap. This decline in the mediating role of the state exposes regions more directly to the effects of the global economy, and forces them to seek opportunities to operate within it and within the emerging transnational regimes. This coincides with the new thinking on economic development, which places less emphasis on central state policies and more on factors rooted in the regions themselves. So the old dyadic exchange between the state and the regions, with the state mediating regions' relations with the global market, has given way to a more complex set of relationships, in which regions operate within the state, but also within transnational regimes and the global economy. Ohmae (1995) has made a lot of this point but takes it beyond all reasonable limits in linking the rise of the regional economy to the decline of the nation-state in a purely functionalist and determinist manner. To understand the phenomenon properly, we need to look at the regions themselves and the political incentive structure they face.

#### WHY DO REGIONS GO ABROAD?

Looking at the new paradiplomacy from the perspective of the regions themselves, we can discern three sets of motivations for them to go into the

international arena: economic, cultural and political. Economically, regions seek investment, markets for their products, and technology for modernization. In a world of increasing mobility, they also promote themselves as tourist destinations. Inward investment is a means for obtaining employment and growth, as well as moving into new economic sectors, but it carries with it the risk of dependency and insecurity, as capital can move out as easily as it moves in. So it is often balanced by policies to build up the local business sector, especially in small and medium-sized firms. Markets and export promotion are of more importance for local small firms, which lack international connections or the knowledge and resources to establish them. Technology transfer is similarly of importance for small firms, which lack their own research and development capacity or the connections to tap into research and development circuits. Regions also seek, by collaboration among small and medium-sized firms in different places, to exploit the same complementarities and synergies that characterize successful industrial districts, again enhancing market competitiveness. As well as promoting inward investment, some regions try to increase the internationalization of their economies and the development of local firms and to develop markets through outward investment. A more altruistic style of external activity is the programmes of assistance to regions in developing countries mounted in some parts of Europe, notably in the Basque Country and in Flanders.

Some regions have sought to build a distinct model of development based on close linkages between government and private business, the assertion of a common territorial interest and the subsequent insertion of the region into the global economy. This neo-corporatist strategy is underpinned by a shared culture and identity and a political project aimed at securing effective functional autonomy for the region, by securing local control of both the political and the economic levers. While keeping economic control in local hands was usually associated in the past with protectionism, it is now allied with a strategy for inserting the regional economy into global markets without being dominated completely by them. The most elaborate such model is found in Quebec, where it has been labelled Quebec Inc. or 'market nationalism' (Courchene, 1990) and is claimed to give Quebec an advantage in facing the challenge of globalization by exploiting the productive potential of social concertation, while responding better to social demands (Latouche, 1993). This strategy can be traced back to the Quiet Revolution of the 1960s, and was later imitated by Flanders. An active external policy is a fundamental part of it.

Regions with their own language or culture also seek resources and support in the international arena, especially where their own state government is unsympathetic or the homeland of the language is in another

state. So, for example, Quebec governments have sought collaboration with France and other francophone countries to gain support for their own cultural development and language promotion. It has gained the right to select its own immigrants and uses this to favour people from francophone countries. Catalonia has promoted its language in departments of Spanish language in universities and academies abroad, and has sought a place for non-state languages in European institutions. Alliances among cultural regions have been forged to lobby state and transnational institutions, for example in the European Bureau for Lesser Used Languages (Price *et al.*, 1997). These seek to promote the use of minority languages in European and international institutions and to secure exemptions for cultural industries in world and continental trade negotiations. International consortia are also used to project and export the cultural production of regions in world markets in a variety of ways, from exchanges of artists and performers to participation in satellite broadcasting syndicates.

Regions have a variety of political reasons for entering the international arena. Those with nationalist aspirations seek recognition and legitimacy as something more than mere regions. For example, at the time of the 1992 Olympic Games, the Catalan government placed advertisements in English-speaking newspapers asking rhetorically 'Where is Barcelona?' The text corrected readers' assumption that it was merely in Spain, by explaining that it was in a distinct nation called Catalonia.<sup>3</sup> External projection may also serve by a reverse effect to help nation-building at home, by showing local leaders in international contexts. Even in regions without nationalist movements, the international arena can be used as a platform for internal region-building, as well as for the projection of the regional politicians themselves. Regions, especially those with distinct historical and cultural identities, may also use diasporas to enhance their political influence in other countries and to mobilize resources. The role of the Irish diaspora has been important at various times in the Northern Ireland conflict and the peace process. The Basque diaspora in America provides an arena for the Basque movement. In other cases, regionally concentrated minorities may look to a motherland for support. So Quebec looks to France for political support in developing its distinct social and political model and, in the case of sovereigntists, for eventual recognition of an independent Quebec. There may be some tendencies developing for chicanos in the southern United States to look to Mexico for support as they assert their distinct place in American society. Territorial minorities across central Europe look to ethnic motherlands for support and assistance in their conflicts with their own states. There may even be efforts to rediscover and revitalize old connections and identities, as in some parts of central Europe where the German heritage is being refurbished as an asset in the new European



market. More focused political campaigns seek to influence public or elite opinion in key foreign countries. In the summer of 1997 British Columbia aired radio commercials in Washington State, giving its side of the fisheries dispute. Quebec has gone to the United States to combat hostility from environmentalists and sympathizers of native peoples towards its hydroelectric schemes, whose viability depends on power exports to the US market. Canadian provinces have also sought to combat hostility in Europe and the United States to their logging and trapping practices. Quebec leaders make regular trips to Wall Street to reassure holders of provincial debt that their bonds will be secure. Nationalist leaders seek to reassure both political and economic opinion-makers in the United States that Quebec independence would not be a threat to them.

#### THE OPPORTUNITY STRUCTURE

Paradiplomacy is part of a broadening of the universe of international affairs, in which states are no longer the sole actors. Regions operate alongside firms, trade unions, social movements and transnational organizations like Greenpeace or Oxfam. This universe is complex, fragmented and unstructured. The global market is particularly complex and many regions have had great difficulty in finding ways to operate within it. For example, many subnational governments in the 1980s sent out missions to attract inward investors with little thought as to how to make an effective pitch, whom to target, or even where to go. This 'scattergun' approach has generally now given way to more selective strategies.

Transnational regimes present another point of access, but this depends on the nature of the regime. NAFTA has important implications for regional development across North America (Conklin, 1997) but presents few opportunities for influence other than through states. The European Union, by contrast, presents a range of such opportunities and these were enlarged and formalized by the Treaty on European Union (Maastricht Treaty). Hence there is a massive amount of regional activity in Europe (Jones and Keating, 1995; Petschen, 1993; Pintarits, 1995; De Castro, 1994; Hooghe, 1996). Regions have established offices in, and sent missions to, Brussels; by 1996, there were 115 such offices (*Europa Magazine*, 1, 1996). Regional lobbying might also coincide with sectoral pressures, where there is an important firm located in the region, allowing approaches through more than one channel. The Committee of the Regions, established by the Maastricht Treaty, gives regional and local governments a formal consultative role alongside the Economic and Social Committee, enabling them to comment on Commission proposals and Council deliberations as well as issues of general concern to regions. Maastricht also provided a

mechanism for some regional input by allowing regions in some instances to stand in for their respective states in the Council of Ministers. This clause, which so far has been interpreted as applying only to the three federal states of Germany, Austria and Belgium, does not allow regions to represent themselves individually since the regions must first agree among themselves and, where national issues impinge, with the national government, on what their position will be. It does, however, represent an important breach in the principle that only national governments are represented in Europe, since where purely regional matters are concerned, it is the regions that speak for the state. Regions have also been drawn into direct contact with European policy-makers through the partnership arrangements for managing the structural funds, which bring together European, national and regional officials.

These opportunities for regions to act in Europe remain limited and states are still the dominant actors. Some regions have sought to expand on their role by promoting the concept of a Europe of the Regions. This rather vague expression has been interpreted in a variety of ways. One, rather utopian, vision sees nation-states – caught between Europe and the regions – fading away, to give rise to a new territorial dispensation, in which economic or cultural units below the existing states will be the principal actors. A more limited concept sees regions emerging as a ‘third level’ in Europe (Bullman, 1994) with a recognized status within European institutions, but still nested within states. A still weaker concept is that of Europe with the Regions, in which the regional dimension of European policies will be increasingly recognized, and opportunities for collaboration and consultation will be developed. The problem with systematizing this is the sheer variety of regions and regional demands. Some regions, with nationalistic leaders, see Europe as permitting them to operate almost like states, escaping the national framework. So Flanders, for example, has set itself the goal of moving from being a ‘third-level’ player to being a ‘second-level’ actor, more like the existing states than the mere regions. For this purpose it has come up with yet another concept, that of ‘Europe of the Cultures’, in which those regions with their own cultures or languages<sup>4</sup> would have a special status. German Länder, for their part, are highly integrated into the national policy-making system and the domestic concessions made to them in the 1990s made them less eager to pursue the Europe of the Regions idea. These concessions included the right to represent the state in the Council of Ministers on regional matters, and a constitutional change requiring Bundesrat consent to any further transfer of powers to Europe. So their preference has been for the ‘third-level’ strategy, allowing them to act both within the German domestic arena and in Europe. The Maastricht Treaty represented the high-water mark of regional

ambitions in the EU. The Amsterdam Treaty gave them nothing very substantial in addition. Demands to strengthen the European level and the position of the regions in it by making the principle of subsidiarity justiciable and giving the regions access to the European Court of Justice to pursue it and other concerns, were not taken up. Some observers have therefore concluded that the 'third level' strategy has run out of steam (Jeffery, 1996).

Another set of opportunities is provided in the inter-state system, with linkages to national governments. Generally, this is difficult, since national governments do not see much to be gained in return, and the state government of the region concerned is likely to see this as a threat to its own diplomatic position. Cases such as the relationship between Quebec and France, where a state considers itself the motherland of the regional population and has a strategic interest in cultivating the link, are the exception. Flanders has nonetheless indicated that henceforth its privileged partners will be states rather than regions.

More common are links and partnerships among subnational governments in different states. These take the form both of multi-purpose or general associations of regions, and of alliances between specific regions. The main multi-purpose associations in Europe are the Council of Local Authorities and Regions of Europe, the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of Europe, which comes under the aegis of the Council of Europe, and the Assembly of European Regions (AER), which covers the whole of Europe but whose main focus is on the European Union. The AER has played an important role in formulating policies and demands for regional representation in the negotiations leading to the Maastricht and Amsterdam treaties. Universal associations like these can play a role in establishing the presence of regions as institutional actors, but they suffer from the heterogeneity of their membership and the very different understanding of what constitutes a region in different European states.

A more focused effort is provided by groups of regions with a narrower geographical or sectoral focus, able to identify common interests and formulate proposals. These started to appear in Europe in the 1970s, the first being the Association of European Frontier Regions (Balme, 1996). In 1973, the Conference of Peripheral Maritime Regions (CPMR) was set up on the initiative of the Breton CELIB. This was followed by the Association of Regions of Industrial Technology (formerly Tradition). These lobby national governments and the European Commission on common problems, and mount inter-regional collaboration programmes such as the Atlantic Arc initiative of the CPMR. The most celebrated sectoral initiative is the Four Motors of Europe, founded as an alliance of Baden-Württemberg, Lombardy, Rhone-Alpes and Catalonia, four advanced regions which felt

neglected by the Commission's emphasis on declining areas (Kukawka, 1996; Morata, 1996). The aim is to establish trans-European networks for research, innovation and production, applying in the single market the lessons learned from territorially-bound industrial districts. The initiative has gained a high political profile and its promoters claim great things for it, although outside observers have often been more reserved, noting that much of the activity is symbolic and pointing to the practical difficulties of co-operation across regions with such different administrative structures, levels of development,<sup>5</sup> and systems of innovation (Borras, 1993). Many other partnerships exist, across Europe and North America, and extending into Asia, focused on economic and cultural collaboration. The reality of these often depends on the enthusiasm of individuals and their willingness to follow them through. The Ontario government has a series of agreements, including an association with the Four Motors of Europe, but some remain empty shells as new governments have failed to pick up on the initiatives of their predecessors. One important focus, with specific implications, is on exchanges among university researchers, teachers and students, but this requires a capacity to follow through on the broad principles and the presence of individuals within the universities themselves who are willing and able to pursue matters.

By far the most common type of inter-regional co-operation is the cross-border initiative. Indeed there is not a single border in western Europe that does not have one. There appears to be a strong functional logic to this, especially where economic or cultural regions are bisected by state boundaries, some of them of quite recent origin. The European Single Market programme, and the INTERREG scheme launched by the European Commission to accompany it, produced a wave of initiatives. NAFTA also produced some interest in cross-border working in North America, but without the impetus provided in Europe by Commission funding. Typically, cross-border initiatives have a functional basis, focused on common problems and opportunities, notably in economic development, promotion, infrastructure, environment or culture. They are most successful where there are complementary assets and resources on either side of the border, and common interests in realizing them. This is most likely to be the case in environmental policy and infrastructure provision. In matters of economic development, it is more difficult, since regions are usually in competition for investment and markets and politicians lack the incentives to take risks which might not benefit their own populations. This can even affect common infrastructure projects, a typical example being the existence of two airports, one on each side of the frontier and neither large enough to serve the needs of growth. Yet neither side is willing to close its own airport to permit the development of the other one to the critical size. Another

factor is the compatibility of legal and administrative systems on each side of the border, and the existence of governments with the powers and resources to undertake common projects. Success is also critically dependent on individual politicians and the way in which they use cross-border working to project an image of dynamism and build political capital. So there are complex games at multiple levels. At one level is the economic and functional context, which points variously to collaboration and the pursuit of common interests, or to competition. Then there is the level of state politics and government, where gatekeepers exist who want to maintain the monopoly of international contacts and channel them through state capitals. The next level is that of regional political entrepreneurs who, by contrast, see cross-border collaboration as a means of escaping central state control, pooling resources and, in the European case, gaining access to EU programmes and funding. The INTERREG programme is significant here in that, as a programme of community initiative, it escapes national control, unlike most of the structural fund initiatives. Finally, there is the micro-political level represented by local actors, often technical or general bureaucrats, and the personal networks that develop among them. These are very difficult for states to control, based as they are on informal links and unwritten communication. Again, cross-border collaboration can be a means for officials on both sides of the border to increase their autonomy from central state control by pooling resources and sharing information.<sup>6</sup>

The combination of these factors means that cross-border co-operation is much better developed in Europe than in North America. In North America, the tradition of inter-regional competition is much more entrenched, affecting states and provinces as well as cities, and there is not a lot of political capital to be gained from co-operating across the border. Politicians on the borders are often suspicious of free trade and are protectionist in sentiment, in contrast to European politicians who are often enthusiastic Europhiles. Cross-border initiatives in economic development and technology transfer are of most use to small and medium sized firms, while the large motor corporations that dominate US–Canadian trade can fend quite well for themselves. Language issues apart, there is often more compatibility between the various European welfare states and attitudes to government than there is among the three countries of North America, making co-operation in joint programmes easier. Finally, in Europe there is the presence of the European Union and its programmes for cross-border initiatives which provide resources to help costs, provide political support against often sceptical national governments, and give guidance and programme assistance for mounting schemes.

## STRATEGIES AND STYLES

The strategies adopted by regions in their external relations are shaped by their motivations and the opportunity structures facing them. Paradiplomacy is not the same as conventional state diplomacy, which is about pursuing a defined state interest in the international arena. It is more functionally specific and targeted, often opportunistic and experimental. There is certainly a strong functional logic to the activity, and we have noted how it has expanded with globalization and the need for regions to operate in the global market. Yet it is not functionally determined, and political considerations play the main role in deciding on strategy and initiatives. This can be seen by contrasting the cases of Ontario and Quebec. The latter has pursued an active external policy as part of a strategy of nation-building, and has embraced free trade as part of this vision. Ontario, by contrast has been until the present government very reticent about free trade, and its external policy is not nearly as well developed as is that of Quebec, despite its even greater degree of insertion into the North American and global economies. Paradiplomacy is also characterized by a high degree of involvement of civil society and the private sector. This varies according to political and institutional factors. In Germany, where there are strong regional governments, these have tended to take it upon themselves to define a regional interest and determine how it should be pursued. In Catalonia, by contrast, there is a stronger role for private associations, often acting in collaboration with, or as agents for, the regional government. Quebec external policy has come to be pursued increasingly in collaboration with business and social interests (Balthazar, 1991), though this may have changed under the Parti Québécois, which has a more specific political agenda.

Relations with the host state vary greatly according to constitutional and political factors. The most permissive constitutional regime is in Belgium, where regions and language communities have full external competence in matters under their purview. They are restricted only in being unable to sign treaties with states with which Belgium does not have diplomatic relations. Since federalization has meant the abolition of national ministries in devolved matters, indeed, Belgium is reliant on the communities and regions for a presence not only in the EU but in organizations like the OECD and UNESCO. Canadian provinces also have a wide legal scope to act abroad, though there is a difference of opinion between the Quebec government, which regards the agreements it has signed abroad as full binding treaties, and the Canadian federal government, which sees them merely as accords. In Germany, the Länder can act abroad, but with fairly strict constitutional limits. Elsewhere in Europe, states try to maintain strict

control. In France, the doctrine of state unity abroad is so entrenched that the constitutional court even refused to allow a constituency system for elections to the European Parliament, on the grounds that only the whole nation, and not individual parts of it, can be represented externally. As is usual in France, this doctrine is softened in the application by all manner of expedients. In Spain and Italy, states have interpreted the constitution in a very restrictive way although, in the last year or two a court ruling (in Spain) and a constitutional amendment (in Italy) have explicitly permitted regions to open offices in Brussels. The United Kingdom has no written constitution, and so British local governments have been among the most active in Europe.

Political relationships also vary. In Quebec, relationships with the federal government are, not surprisingly, worse when the nationalist Parti Québécois (PQ) is in power. Yet paradiplomacy is emphasized rather more by governments of the Quebec Liberal Party, which see it as an instrument of stateless nation-building, without requiring difficult constitutional changes. The PQ, for its part, gives priority to the achievement of independence, which will permit a full external diplomatic presence. So it was a PQ government that recently closed most of Quebec's offices abroad. Relations in Spain depend on the relationship of the political parties, notably the relationships with the central government of the dominant moderate nationalist parties of Catalonia and the Basque Country. Where they are in alliance with the central government, as under the Socialists 1993–96 and the conservative Popular Party after 1996, conflict is moderated and co-operation is enhanced. More generally, Catalan representatives abroad have sought co-operation with Spanish diplomacy rather than confrontation, in order to increase effectiveness. The Catalan government has also sought to distinguish its own role from that of traditional diplomacy.<sup>7</sup> In Belgium, the potential for conflict is reduced by the tendency for governing coalitions to be reflected at national and regional/community level. Since 1995, however, these have been elected separately, and as from the next elections the national and regional/community elections will no longer be held on the same day, so a divergence of political opinion can be expected. In Germany, there has been some tendency recently for the stronger Länder to operate increasingly outside the framework of co-operative federalism and to seek their own presence in the exterior. In the United Kingdom, relationships between central and sub-state governments are highly partisan and governments are suspicious of anything that might give opposition forces a platform. There was great tension under the late Conservative administration, a centralizing and increasingly anti-European government facing a periphery that was increasingly assertive and pro-European. Forced by functional necessities to

establish a bureau to represent Scottish interests in Brussels, the government insisted that its mission should be economic rather than political representation and that Scotland Europa should provide a shelter for Scottish interest groups rather than articulating a 'Scottish interest' itself. The 1998 devolution legislation, however, allows the Scottish Parliament to establish a political presence in Brussels.

Foreign ministries have, not surprisingly, looked askance at regional activities abroad, seeing them as a breach of the united diplomatic front, and they go to immense lengths to control them. The French–Belgian cross-border regional collaboration teams were given an extremely top-heavy committee structure, including the French ambassador in Brussels, to bring them into the diplomatic fold. In the early 1980s, the British Foreign Office waged a war against the inward investment activities of the Scottish Development Agency and its offices abroad. Eventually a compromise was reached whereby they were subsumed in a new agency, Locate in Scotland, coming under more direct control from the Scottish Office which, as a ministry of the central government, was more easily controlled.

#### THE LIMITS OF PARADIPLOMACY

Paradiplomacy is a rather recent phenomenon and subject to a great deal of trial and error, as regions experiment to see what works and what is cost-effective. Some regions have been adding the costs and benefits, and are coming to realize that a great deal of what they have been doing is of doubtful value. There has in consequence been some retrenchment. Ontario and Quebec have closed most of their overseas offices and some European regions have closed their missions in Brussels. The efforts to institutionalize a third level in the EU did not ultimately succeed (Jeffery, 1996). Immense practical problems have emerged in efforts to secure inter-regional collaboration and co-operation, including the realities of territorial competition, differing constitutional and legal provisions, and the resistance of politicians and officials who have a continued stake in the existence of borders and central control. Paradiplomacy has not, therefore, proved state-transforming, except where states are already disintegrating for other reasons, as in Belgium or perhaps Canada. In those cases where regions encapsulate a sense of distinct national identity and a nation-building project, external projection is qualitatively different from those cases where it is motivated only by functional considerations. In the former, paradiplomacy is used in a highly political manner, either to prepare the ground for eventual independence, or as an element in stateless nation-building, a strategy to acquire as much as possible of the substance of national independence, without worrying too much about the formal status.



Paradiplomacy, while for the most part unspectacular, does represent an important and new dimension both to regionalism and to international relations, further evidence of the breakdown of the distinction between domestic and international affairs and between national and regional matters. As political leaders and publics are able increasingly to adopt multiple identities and roles in different contexts, they are more able to span the old state–international divide. Policy making is increasingly a matter of complex networks that cannot be contained neatly within political institutions, spanning both the public and private divide and international borders. It becomes more important, therefore, for politicians and officials to be able to operate in different arenas, and to link up powers, resources and opportunities found among them. This does not in itself imply that regions will become more important. There are many territorial and sectoral interests seeking expression in the international arena. The very forces of globalization that are drawing regions into the international arena may serve to disarticulate the region as a system of action, as different elements are drawn differentially into distinct global networks. Links between sectoral and territorial lobbies may be broken. Even local business interests may, as they are drawn into the global market, lose their territorial identity, while the neo-corporatist connections that underlie, for example, the Quebec model of development, may be under strain in the global market place. Regions will only be important to the extent that they have institutions and leadership capable of arriving at a definition of the regional interest, articulating this and devising policies to pursue it. This capacity varies, so that in some cases we find powerful regional governments pursuing a defined interest; in others there are competing versions of the territorial interest, often pitching a development coalition based on the region against one focused on a big city or metropolitan area;<sup>8</sup> in other cases again, there is no articulated territorial interest. So, for all the functionalist determinism of observers like Ohmae (1995), it is politics that ultimately counts.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This paper was written while I was visiting scholar the Rockefeller Foundation Study and Conference Center at Bellagio, Italy, in August 1997.

#### NOTES

1. I do not refer here to the 'Westphalian state' since I do not share the view that the present state system dates from 1648. The only European state to retain its Westphalian borders in 1997 is Portugal. The state system as we know it is largely the product of the second half of the nineteenth century and of the Versailles settlement of 1919. For a historical critique of the Westphalian fallacy, see Osiander (1994). The reason for emphasizing this point is to stress that state borders have long been permeable in many respects, and remained so until

- the First World War and the collapse of the international trading system in the 1930s.
2. I use this term rather loosely to avoid entering the scholastic debate on the existence or meaning of 'international regimes.'
  3. This type of ignorance is not confined to large states. Many Catalans and Basques, including nationalists, are insensitive to the *multinational* nature of the United Kingdom, referring to it as 'England.'
  4. Effectively this means minority nations, but this terminology is not used. The concept also includes independent states which are small nations, such as Ireland and Denmark.
  5. Each claims to be the most advanced region within its own state but, on a European scale, there are big differences between Baden-Württemberg and Catalonia.
  6. Information is an important power resource here. In one set of interviews, French local officials revealed that, deprived of information by Paris, they went to their Flemish colleagues, who are in a more powerful position, and obtained the data from them.
  7. Jordi Pujol has said that Catalonia has 'una presencia internacional, y no digo una politica exterior; me gustaria que quedara clara esta precision', *El Pais*, 15 Dec. 1993.
  8. For example, the rivalry between the Generalitat of Catalonia and the city of Barcelona (Morata, 1996).

## REFERENCES

- Amin, A. and N. Thrift (1994), 'Living in the Global', in A. Amin and N. Thrift (eds), *Globalization, Institutions, and Regional Development* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Badie, B. (1995), *La fin des territoires. Essai sur le désordre international et sur l'utilité social du respect* (Paris: Fayard).
- Balme, R. (1996), 'Pourquoi le gouvernement change-t-il d'échelle?', in R. Balme (ed.), *Les politiques du néo-régionalisme* (Paris: Economica).
- Balthazar, L. (1991), 'Conscience nationale et contexte internationale', in L. Balthazar, G. Laforest and V. Lemieux (eds), *Le Québec et la restructuration du Canada, 1980-1992. Enjeux et perspectives* (Sillery, Quebec: Septentrion).
- Borras, S. (1993), 'The "Four Motors of Europe" and its Promotion of R&D Linkages: Beyond Geographic Contiguity in Inter-Regional Agreements', *Regional Politics and Policy*, Vol.3, No.3, pp.163-76.
- Bullman, U. (ed.) (1994), *Die Politik der dritten Ebene. Regionen im Europa der Union* (Baden-Baden: NOMOS).
- Camilleri, J. and J. Falk (1992), *The End of Sovereignty? The Politics of a Shrinking and Fragmenting World* (Aldershot: Edward Elgar).
- Conklin, D. (1997), 'NAFTA: Regional Impacts', in M. Keating and J. Loughlin (eds), *The Political Economy of Regionalism* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass), pp.195-214.
- Courchene, T. (1990), *Quebec Inc. Foreign Takeovers, Competition/Mergers Policy and Universal Banking* (Kingston, Ont.: School of Policy Studies, Queen's University).
- De Castro Ruano, J.-L. (1994), *La emergente participación política de las regiones en el proceso de construcción europea* (Vitoria: Instituto Vasco de Administración Pública).
- Duchacek, I., D. Latouche and G. Stevenson (1988), *Perforated Sovereignties and International Relations* (New York: Greenwood).
- Dunford, M. and G. Kafkalas (1992), 'The Global-Local Interplay, Corporate Geographies and Spatial Development Strategies in Europe', in M. Dunford and G. Kafkalas (eds), *Cities and Regions in the New Europe* (London: Belhaven).
- Hocking, B. (1997), 'Regions and International Relations' in M. Keating and J. Loughlin (eds), *The Political Economy of Regionalism* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass).
- Hooghe, L. (ed.) (1996), *Cohesion Policy and European Integration* (Oxford: Clarendon).
- Jeffery, C. (1996), 'Farewell the Third Level? The German Länder and the European Policy Process', *Regional and Federal Studies*, Vol.6, No.2, pp.56-75.
- Jones, B. and M. Keating (eds) (1995), *The European Union and the Regions* (Oxford: Clarendon).

- Keating, M. (1997), 'Stateless Nation Building. Quebec, Catalonia and Scotland in the Changing State System', *Nations and Nationalism*, Vol.3, No.4, pp.689–717.
- Keating, M. (1998), *The New Regionalism in Western Europe: Territorial Restructuring and Political Change* (Aldershot: Edward Elgar).
- Kukawka, P. (1996), 'La Quadrige européen ou l'Europe par les régions', in R. Balme (ed.), *Les politiques du néo-régionalisme* (Paris: Economica).
- Latouche, D. (1993), "'Quebec, See Canada": Quebec Nationalism in the New Global Age', in A-G. Gagnon (ed.), *Quebec. State and Society*, 2nd edn. (Scarborough: Nelson Canada).
- Morata, F. (1996), 'Barcelone et la Catalogne dans l'arène européenne', in R. Balme (ed.), *Les politiques du néo-régionalisme* (Paris: Economica).
- Ohmae, Kenichi (1995), *The End of the Nation State. The Rise of Regional Economies* (New York: Fress Press).
- Osiander, A. (1994), *The States System of Europe, 1640–1990. Peace-making and the Conditions of International Stability* (Oxford; Clarendon).
- Petschen, S. (1993), *La Europa de las regiones* (Barcelona: Generalitat de Catalunya).
- Pintarits, S. (1995), *Macht, Demokratie und Regionen in Europa. Analysen und Szenarien de Integration und Desintegration* (Marburg: Metropolis).
- Price, A., C. O'Torna and A. Wynne Jones (1997), *The Diversity Dividend. Language, Culture and Economy in an Integrated Europe* (Brussels: European Bureau for Lesser Used Languages).
- Storper, M. (1995), 'The Resurgence of Regional Economies, Ten Years Later: The Region as a Nexus of Untraded Interdependencies', *European Urban and Regional Studies*, Vol.2, No.2, pp.191–221.

# References

## Regions and International Affairs: Motives, Opportunities and Strategies

Amin, A. and N. Thrift (1994), 'Living in the Global', in A. Amin and N. Thrift (eds), *Globalization, Institutions, and Regional Development* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Badie, B. (1995), *La fin des territoires. Essai sur le désordre international et sur l'utilité sociale du respect* (Paris: Fayard).

Balme, R. (1996), 'Pourquoi le gouvernement change-t-il d'échelle?', in R. Balme (ed.), *Les politiques du néo-régionalisme* (Paris: Economica).

Balthazar, L. (1991), 'Conscience nationale et contexte internationale', in L. Balthazar, G. Laforest and V. Lemieux (eds), *Le Québec et la restructuration du Canada, 1980-1992. Enjeux et perspectives* (Sillery, Québec: Septentrion).

Borras, S. (1993), 'The "Four Motors of Europe" and its Promotion of R&D Linkages: Beyond Geographic Contiguity in Inter-Regional Agreements, Regional Politics and Policy', Vol.3, No.3, pp.163-76.

Bullman, U. (ed.) (1994), *Die Politik der dritten Ebene. Regionen im Europa der Union* (BadenBaden: NOMOS).

Camilleri, J. and J. Falk (1992), *The End of Sovereignty? The Politics of a Shrinking and Fragmenting World* (Aldershot: Edward Elgar).

Conklin, D. (1997), 'NAFFA: Regional Impacts', in M. Keating and J. Loughlin (eds), *The Political Economy of Regionalism* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass), pp.195-214.

Courchene, T. (1990), *Quebec Inc. Foreign Takeovers, Competition/Mergers Policy and Universal Banking* (Kingston, Ont.: School of Policy Studies, Queen's University).

De Castro Ruano, J-L. (1994), *La emergente participación política de las regiones en el proceso de construcción europea* (Vitoria: Instituto Vasco de Administración Pública).

- Duchacek, I., D. Latouche and G. Stevenson (1988), *Perforated Sovereignties and International Relations* (New York: Greenwood).
- Dunford, M. and G. Kafkalas (1992), 'The Global-Local Interplay, Corporate Geographies and Spatial Development Strategies in Europe', in M. Dunford and G. Kafkalas (eds), *Cities and Regions in the New Europe* (London: Belhaven).
- Hocking, B. (1997), 'Regions and International Relations' in M. Keating and I. Loughlin (eds), *The Political Economy of Regionalism* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass).
- Hooghe, L. (ed.) (1996), *Cohesion Policy and European Integration* (Oxford: Clarendon).
- Jeffery, C. (1996), 'Farewell the Third Level? The German Lander and the European Policy Process', *Regional and Federal Studies*, Vol.6, No.2, pp.56-75.
- Jones, B. and M. Keating (eds) (1995), *The European Union and the Regions* (Oxford: Clarendon).
- Keating, M. (1997), 'Stateless Nation Building. Quebec, Catalonia and Scotland in the Changing State System', *Nations and Nationalism*, Vol.3, No.4, pp.689-717.
- Keating, M. (1998), *The New Regionalism in Western Europe: Territorial Restructuring and Political Change* (Aldershot: Edward Elgar).
- Kukawka, P. (1996), 'La Quadrige europeen ou l'Europe par les regions', in R. Balme (ed), *Les politiques du neo-regionalisme* (Paris: Economica).
- Latouche, D. (1993), ''Quebec, See Canada': Quebec Nationalism in the New Global Age', in A-G. Gagnon (ed.), *Quebec. State and Society*, 2nd edn. (Scarborough: Nelson Canada).
- Morata, F. (1996), 'Barcelone et la Catalogne dans l'arene europeenne', in R. Balme (ed.), *Les politiques du neo-regionalisme* (Paris: Econornica).
- Ohmae, Kenichi (1995), *The End of the Nation State. The Rise of Regional Economies* (New York: Fress Press).
- Osiander, A. (1994), *The States System of Europe, 1640-1990. Peace-making and the Conditions of*

International Stability (Oxford; Clarendon).

Petschen, S. (1993), La Europa de las regiones (Barcelona: Generalitat de Catalunya).

Pintarits, S. (1995), Macht, Demokratie und Regionen in Europa. Analysen und Szenarien de Integration und Desintegration (Marburg: Metropolis).

Price, A., C. O'Toma and A. Wynne Jones (1997), The Diversity Dividend. Language, Culture and Economy in an Integrated Europe (Brussels: European Bureau for Lesser Used Languages).

Storper, M. (1995), 'The Resurgence of Regional Economies, Ten Years Later: The Region as a Nexus of Untraded Interdependencies', European Urban and Regional Studies, Vol.2, No.2, pp.191-221.

# Patrolling the 'Frontier': Globalization, Localization and the 'Actorness' of Non-Central Governments

Ammon, G. (1996) *L'Europe des Regions* (Paris: Economica).

Anderson, J. and J. Goodman (1995) 'Regions, States and the European Union: Modernist Reaction Or Postmodern Adaptation?', *Review of International Political Economy*, Vol.2, No.4, pp.600-631.

Authers, J. (1998) 'Tangled Negotiations on the Road to \$1.25bn Accord', *Financial Times*, 14 August.

Boardman, R. (1990) *Global Regimes and Nation States: Environmental Issues in Australian Politics* (Ottawa: Carleton University Press).

Brown, S. (1995) *New Forces, Old Forces and the Future of World Politics* (post-Cold War edition) (New York: HarperCollins).

Buckley, N. (1997) 'Brussels Worried By Law on Burma', *Financial Times*, 24 June.

Cohn, T.H. and P.J. Smith (1996) 'Subnational Governments as International Actors: Constituent Diplomacy in British Columbia and the Pacific Northwest' *BC Studies*, Vol.110 (Summer).

Colgan, C.S. (1992) *Forging a New Partnership in Trade Policy Between the Federal and State Governments* (Washington, DC: National Governors' Association).

Courchene, T.J. (1995) 'Globalization: The Regional/International Interface', *Canadian Journal of Regional Science*, Vol.18, No.1.

Delamaide, D. (1995) *The New Superregions of Europe* (New York: Plume).

Evans, P.B., H.K. Jacobson, and R.D. Putnam, (eds) (1993) *Double-Edged Diplomacy: International Bargaining and Domestic Politics* (Berkeley: University of California Press).

Fraga Iribarne, M. (1998) 'Regional Government in Europe: Legal and Constitutional Implications', *British Council European Senior Civil Servants Seminar: How Europe Is Working: Constitutional Issues and Accountability*

(Worcester, Oxford).

Gentler, M.S. and D.A. Wolfe (March 1997) 'Region State Networking: Ontario and the Four Motors for Europe'. Paper presented to the 38th International Studies Association Convention, Toronto.

Goldsborough, J.O. (1993) 'California's Foreign Policy', Foreign Affairs, Vol.72.

Groen, J.P. (1994) 'British Columbia's International Relations: Consolidating A CoalitionBuilding Strategy', BC Studies, Vol. I 02 (Summer).

The Hague, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (September 1995) The Foreign Policy of the Netherlands: A Review, pp.46-7.

Hall, W. (1998) 'Happy 150th and Cheer Up, Swiss Told', Financial Times, 1-2 August.

Hill, C. (1993) 'The Capability-Expectations Gap, Or Conceptualising Europe's International Role', Journal of Common Market Studies, Vol.31, No.3.

Hobbs, H.H. (1994) City Hall Goes Abroad: the Foreign Policy of Local Politics (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage).

Hocking, B. (1995) Beyond 'Newness' and 'Decline': The Development of Catalytic Diplomacy. Discussion Paper No. 10, Diplomatic Studies Programme, University of Leicester.

Hocking, B. (1996) 'The Woods and the Trees: Catalytic Diplomacy and Canada's Trials as a 'Forestry Superpower'', Environmental Politics, Vol.1.5, No.3.

Hocking, B. (1993), Localizing Foreign Policy: Non-Central Governments and Multilayered Diplomacy, London, Macmillan, Ch.2

Hocking, B. and M. Smith (1995) World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations (2nd edition) (Hemel Hempstead: Prentice Hall/Harvester Wheatsheaf).

Hocking, B. and M. Smith (1997) Beyond Foreign Economic Policy: The United States, the Single European Market and the Changing World Economy (London: Pinter).

Jeffery, C. (1994) The Lander Strike Back: Structures and Procedures of European Integration Policy-Making in the German Federal System. Discussion Papers in Federal



Studies, University of Leicester.

Johnston, R.I., M.J. Taylor and M.I. Watts (eds) (1995) *Geographies of Global Change: Remapping the World in the Late Twentieth Century* (Oxford: Blackwell).

De Jonquieres, G. (1997) 'Business Worried By US States' Sanctions' *Financial Times*, 11 March.

Keating, M. and J. Loughlin (eds) (1997) *The Political Economy of Regionalism* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass).

Kincaid, J. (1997) *American Cities in the Global Economy: a Survey of Municipalities on Activities and Attitudes* (Washington, DC: National League of Cities).

Kramer, R. (1997) *Transfederal Relations of the Eastern Lander. The Case of Brandenburg*. University of Birmingham, Institute of German Studies, IGS Discussion Paper Series Number 97/9.

Kresl, P.K. (1992) 'The Response of European Cities to EC 1992', *Journal of European Integration*, Vol15, Nos 2&3.

Kux, S. (1994) *Subsidiarity and the Environment: Implementing International Agreements* (EuropaInstitut, University of Basel).

La Palombara, J. (1994) 'International Firms and National Governments: Some Dilemmas', *The Washington Quarterly*, Vol7, No.2, pp.89-99.

Latouche, D. (1988) 'State Building and Foreign Policy at the Subnational Level' in D. Duchacek, D. Latouche and G. Stevenson (eds) *Perforated Sovereignities and International Relations* (New York: Greenwood Press).

MacMillan, I. and A. Linklater (eds) (1995) *Boundaries in Question: New Directions in International Relations* (London: Pinter).

Marks, G., L. Hooghe and K. Blank (1996) 'European Integration from the 1980s: State Centric v Multi-Level Governance', *Journal of Common Market Studies*, Vol134, No.3.

Matthews, J.T. (1997) 'Power Shift', *Foreign Affairs*, Vol76, No.1, pp.50-66.

- National Governors' Association (1989), *America in Transition: The International Frontier: Report of the Task Force on Foreign Markets*, Washington, DC.
- Morata, F. (1996) 'Spain', in Rometsch and Wessels, pp.143-7.
- Newhouse, J. (1997) 'Europe's Rising Regionalism', *Foreign Affairs*, January/February.
- Northdurft, WE. (1992) *Going Global: How Europe Helps Small Firms Export* (Washington, DC: Brookings).
- Ohmae, K. (1995) *The End of the Nation State: The Rise of Regional Economies* (London: HarperCollins ).
- Owen, D. (1997) 'Pulling Together at the Heart of Europe', *Financial Times Survey: RhoneAlpes*, 20 May, p.1.
- Paarlberg, R.L. (1995) *Leadership Abroad Begins at Home: US Foreign Economic Policy After the Cold War* (Washington, DC: Brookings).
- Porter, G. and J.W Brown (1991) *Global Environmental Politics* (Boulder, CO: Westview).
- Risse-Kappen, T. (1995) 'Structures of Governance and Transnational Relations: What Have We Learned?' in T. Risse-Kappen (ed.) *Bringing Transnational Relations Back In: Non-State Actors, Domestic Structures and International Institutions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Roberts, B. (1991) *Competition across the Atlantic: the States Face Europe '92* (Denver, CO, National Council of State Legislatures).
- Rodrik, D. (1997) 'Sense and Nonsense in the Globalization Debate', *Foreign Policy*, Vol.107, (Summer), pp.21-2.
- Rometsch, D. (1996) 'The Federal Republic of Germany', in Rometsch and Wessels, pp.82-91.
- Rometsch, D. and W. Wessels (eds) (1996) *The European Union and Member States: Towards Institutional Fusion?* (Manchester: Manchester University Press).
- Rosecrance, R. (1996) 'The Rise of the Virtual State', *Foreign Affairs*, Vol.75, NoA, ppA5-61. 39

Rosenau, J.N. (1997) *Along the Domestic-Foreign Frontier: Exploring Governance in a Turbulent World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Strange, S. (1992) 'States, Firms and Diplomacy', *International Affairs*, Vol.68, No.1, pp.1-15.

Taylor, P.J., M.I. Watts and R.J. Johnston, 'Global Change at the End of the Twentieth Century' in R.I. Johnston, P.I. Taylor and M.I. Watts (eds), *Geographies of Global Change: Remapping the World in the Late Twentieth Century* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1995).

Van Schendelen, M.P.C.M. (1993) *National Public and Private EC Lobbying* (Dartmouth: Aldershot).

# Diplomacy and Paradiplomacy in the Redefinition of International Security: Dimensions of Conflict and Co-operation

Alcock, A. (1992) 'The Protection of Regional Cultural Minorities and the Process of European Integration: The Example of South Tyrol', *International Relations*, Vol.XI, No.1, pp.17-36.

Alcock, A. (1994) 'South Tyrol', in H. Miall (ed.): *Minority Rights in Europe: The Scope for a Transnational Regime* (London: RIINPinter), pp.46-55.

Allee, D.1. (1993) 'Subnational Governance and the International Joint Commission: Local Management of United States and Canadian Boundary Waters', *Natural Resources Journal*, Vol.33, No.1.

Anderson, M.S. (1993) *The Rise of Modern Diplomacy* (Longman:New York).

Asiwaju, A.J. (1994) 'Borders and Borderlands as Linnchpins for Regional Integration in Africa: Lessons of the European Experience', in C.H. Scholied (ed.) *World Boundaries/Global Boundaries* (London: Routledge).

Balme, R. (ed.) (1996) *Les politiques du Neo-Regionalisme* (Paris: Economica).

Banuazizi, A. and M. Weiner (eds) (1994) *The New Geopolitics of Central Asia and its Borderlands* (London, Paris).

Barston, R.P. (1988) *Modern Diplomacy* (Longman: New York).

Batt, J. (1998) 'Federalism versus Nationalism in Postcommunist State Building', *Regional & Federal Studies*, Vol.7, No.3, pp.25-48.

Beck, U. (1992) *Risk Society: Towards a New Modernity* (London: Sage).

Bernal Meza, R. (1990) 'Papel de las regiones en la formulaci3n de la politica exterior y potencial de articulaci3n con regiones de paises limitrofes: antecedentes y perspectivas', *Integraci3n Latinoamericana*, No.156, pp.28-39.

Berridge, G.R. (1995) *Diplomacy: Theory and Practice* (London: Prentice Hall).

- Bew, P. and E. Meehan (1994) 'Regions and Borders: Controversies in Northern Ireland about the European Union', *Journal of European Public Policy*, VoU, No.1, pp.95-113.
- Biucchi, B. and G. Gaudard (ed.) (1981) *Regions Frontalieres et Integration Europeenne* (St. Saphorin: Georgi).
- Blum, D.W. (1994) 'Desintegration and Russian Foreign Policy', in D.W. Blum (ed.) *Russia's Future: Consolidation or Desintegration?* (Boulder: Westview Press), pp.127-45.
- Bokatola, I. (1992) *L'Organization des Nations Unies et la Protection des Minorites* (Bruselas: Bruylant).
- Bolognissi-Drosdoff, M.e. (1990) 'Iniciativas de integraci6n fronteriza en America Latina', *Integraci6n Latinoamericana*, No.156, pp.28-39.
- Bondarevsky, G. and P. Ferdinand (1994) 'Russian Foreign Policy and Central Asia', in P. Ferdinand (ed.) *The New Central Asia and Its Neighbours* (London: RILNPinter), pp.36-54
- Broen, M.E. (ed.) (1993) *Ethnic Conflict and International Security* (Princeton: Princeton University Press).
- Buchanan, A (1991) *Secession: The Morality of Political Divorce from Fort Sumter to Lithuania and Quebec* (Boulder: Westview Press).
- Cassese, A. (1994) *Self-Determination of Peoples: A Legal Reappraisal* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Chaudhuri, Y. (1993) 'Federalism and the Siamese Twins: Diversity and Entropy in India's Domestic and Foreign Policy', *International Journal*, VoI.XLVIII, No.2, pp.448-69.
- Christoffersen, G. (1993) 'Xinjiang and the Great Islamic Circle: The Impact of Transnational Economic forces on Chinese Regional Economic Planning', *The China Quarterly*, No.133, pp.130-53.
- Cleaver, H. (1994) 'The Chiapas Uprising', *Studies in Political Economy*, No.44, pp.141-57.
- Coakley, J. (1992) 'The Resolution of Ethnic Conflict: Towards a Typology', *International Political Science*

Review, VoU3, No.4, pp.343-58.

Cohen, L.J. (1986) 'Federalism and Foreign Policy in Yugoslavia: The Politics of Regional Ethnonationalism', International Journal, VoI.XLI, pp.624-54.

Constantin, F. (1994) 'La transnationalite: de l'individu a l'etat. A propos des modes populaires d'action internationales en Afrique orientale', in M. Girard (ed.) Les individus dans la politique internationale (paris: Economica), pp.154-77.

Comago, N. (1999) 'Diplomacy', in L. Kurtz (ed.) Encyclopedia of Violence, Peace and Conflict (San Diego: Academic Press).

Cuthbertson, I.M. and J. Leibowitz (eds) (1993) Minorities: The New Europe's Old Issue (Boulder: Westview Press|Institut for East|West Studies).

Dalton, R (1994) 'International and European Standards on Minority Rights', in H. Miall (ed.) Minority Rights in Europe: The Scope for a Transnational Regime (London: RIIA/Pinter), p.1 02.

Dewitt, D., D. Haglund and J. Kirton (eds) (1993) Building A New Global Order: Emergent Trends in International Security (Oxford:Oxford University Press).

Diamond, L. and J.w. McDonald (1993) Multitrack Diplomacy: A Systems Approach to Peace (Washington, DC: Institut for Multi Track Diplomacy).

Dietz, G. (1995) 'Zapatismo y movimientos etnico-regionales en Mexico', Nueva Sociedad, No.140, pp.33-50.

Dreyer, I. T. (1994) 'The Popular Liberation Army and Regionalism in Xinjiang' , Pacific Review, Vo1.7, No.1, pp.41-55.

Dunn.TJ. (1995) The Militarization of the U.S.-Mexico border, 1978-1992: Law intensity Conflict Doctrine Comes Home (Austin: University of Texas Press).

Dyment, D.K.M. (1993) 'Substate Paradiplomacy: The Case of Ontario', in B. Hocking (ed.) Foreign Relations and Federal States (London: Leicester University Press).

Eide, A. (1993) New Approaches to Minority Protection (London: Minority Rights Groups).

- Ercmann, S. (ed.) (1987) *Transatlantic Colloquy on Crossborder Relations: European and North American Perspectives* (Zurich: Schulthess Polygraphischer Verlag).
- Ferdinand, P. (1994) 'The New Central Asia and China', in P. Ferdinand (ed.) *The New Central Asia and Its Neighbours* (London: RIIALPinter), pp.95-107.
- Foucher, M. (1991) *Fronts et Frontieres: Un Tour du Monde Geopolitique* (Paris: Fayard).
- Ghebali, V.Y. (1996) 'L 'Europe joue des bons offices', *Temps Europeens*, No.1, pp.105-8.
- Godron, A. (1996) 'Le bassin de l 'Amour: une nouvelle zone de co-operation entre la Chine et la Russie' , *Le Courrier des Pays de l 'Est*, No.406.
- Gonzalez-Posse, E. (1990) 'Marco conceptual de la integraci6n fronteriza promovida: las iniciativas de integraci6n fronteriza', *Integraci6n Latinoamericana*, No.156.
- Goodman, D.S. and G. Segal (eds) (1995) *China Deconstructs: Politics, Trade and Regionalism* (London: Routledge).
- Gurr, T.R. and B. Harff (1994) *Ethnic Conflicts in World Politics* (Boulder: Westview Press).
- Halperin, M.H. and DJ. Schaeffer (1992) *Self-Determination in the New World Order 55* (Washington: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace).
- Hamilton, K. and R. Langhorne (1995) *The Practice of Diplomacy: Its Evolution, Theory and Administration* (London: Routledge).
- Hannum, H. (1990) *Autonomy, Sovereignty and Self-Determination: The Accommodation of Conflicting Rights* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press).
- Hansen, N. (1984) 'Transboundary Co-operation in Centralist States: Conflicts and Responses in France and Mexico', *Publius*, Vol.14, pp.137-52.
- Hauslohner, P. (1981) 'Prefects as Senators: Soviet Regional Politicians Look to Foreign Policy', *World Politics*, Vol.33, No.1, pp.197-232.

Heraclides, A. (1991) *The Self-Determination of Minorities in International Politics* (London and Portland OR: Frank Cass).

Herzog, L. (ed.) (1992) *Changing Boundaries in the Americas: New Perspectives on the United States-Mexican, Central American, and South American Borders* (San Diego: Center for United States-Mexican Studies).

Hocking, B. (1993a) *Localizing Foreign Policy: Non-Central Governments and Multilayered Diplomacy* (London: Macmillan).

Hocking, B. (ed.) (1993b) *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London: Leicester University Press).

Hocking, B. (1995) 'The Woods and the Trees: Catalytic Diplomacy and Canada's Trials as a Forestry 'Superpower'', *Environmental Politics*, Vol.1.5, No.3, pp.448-75.

Jackson, R.H. (1990) *Quasi-States: Sovereignty, International Relations and the Third World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Keating, M. (1996) *Naciones contra el Estado* (Barcelona: Ariel).

Keohane, R.O. and E. Ostrom (ed.) (1994) *Local Commons and Global Interdependence: Heterogeneity and Co-operation in Two Domains* (London: Sage).

Klare, M.T. and D.C. Thomas (eds) (1994) *World Security: Challenges For a New Century* (New York: St. Martin's Press).

Kruszewski, Z.A. (1986) 'Border Problem Solving in the Communist World: A Case Study of Some European Boundaries', in Martinez, O.

Lapidus, G.W. and E.W. Walker (1993) 'Nationalism, Regionalism, and Federalism: Center-Periphery Relations in Post-Communist Russia', in G.W. Lapidus (ed.) *The New Russia: Troubled Transformation* (Boulder: Westview Press), pp.79-113.

Liebich, A. and A. Reszler (eds) (1993) *L'Europe Centrale et ses minorites: vers une solution europeenne?* (Paris: P.U.F).



Luben, I. (1991) *Une Structure transfrontaliere en Europe Centrale, des Alpes d I'Adriatique* (Paris: FEDN).

Luhman, N. (1982) 'Territorial Borders as System Boundaries', in R Strassoldo and G. Delli Zioti (eds) *Co-operation in Conflict in Border Areas* (Milan: Franco Angelli), pp.235-44.

Luhman, N. (1993) *Risk: A Sociological Theory* (New York: Aldine de Gruyter).

Luke, T.W. (1994) 'Placing Power/Sitting Space: The Politics of Global and Local in the New World Order', *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, Vol.12, pp.613-28.

Lund, M.S. (1996) *Preventing Violent Conflicts: A Strategy for Preventive Diplomacy* (Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press)

Lynn Jones, S.M. and S.E. Miller (eds) (1995) *Global Dangers: Changing Dimensions of International Security* (Cambridge: The MIT Press).

Maillot, D. (1990) 'Transborder Relations Between Members of the European Community and Non Member Countries', *Built Environment*, No.16, pp.25-37.

Malik, H .. (ed.) (1994) *Central Asia: Its Strategic Importance and Future Prospects* (New York: St. Martin Press).

Manno, J.P. (1994) 'Advocacy and Diplomacy: NGOs and the Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement', in T. Princen and M. Finger (eds) *Environmental NGOs in World Politics: Linking the Local and the Global* (London: Routledge), pp.69-120.

Martinez, O. (ed.) (1986) *Across Boundaries: Transborder Interaction in Comparative Perspective* (El Paso: Western Press/University of Texas).

Maung, M. (1994) 'On the Road to Mandalay: A Case Study of the Sinonization of Upper Burma', *Asian Survey*, Vol.34, No.5, pp.447-59.

Mawdsley, E. (1997) 'Nonsecessionist Regionalism in India: The Uttarakhand Separate State

56 Movement', *Environment and Planning A*, Vol.29,

pp.2217-35.

McGarry, J. and B.O'Leary (eds) (1993) *The Politics of Ethnic Conflict Regulation* (London: Routledge).

Melvin, N. (1995) *Regional Foreign Policies in the Russian Federation* (London: RIIA).

Miall, H. (ed.) (1994) *Minority Rights in Europe: The Scope for a Transnational Regime* (London: RIIA/Pinter).

Mildarsky, M.I. (ed.) (1993) *The Internationalization of Communal Strife* (London: Routledge).

Moltz, J.C. (1995) 'Regional Tensions in the Russo-Chinese rapprochement', *Asian Survey*, Vol.35, No.6.

Montville, I.V. (ed.) (1990) *Conflict and Peacemaking in Multiethnic Societies* (Lexington: Lexington Books).

Morrow, D. (1992) 'Regional Policy as Foreign Policy: The Austrian Experience', *Regional Politics & Policy*. Vol.2, No.3, pp.27-44.

Mumme, S.P. (1984) 'Regional Power in National Diplomacy: The Case of the U.S. Section of the International Boundary and Water Commission', *Publius*, Vol.14, No.3.

Muni, S.D. (1989) 'India and Its Neighbours: Persisting Dilemmas and New Opportunities', *International Studies*, Vol.Xn, No.1.

Nugent, P. and A.I. Asiwaju (1996) *African Boundaries* (London: Pinter).

Oliveros, RL. (1995) 'Situación actual y perspectivas de las relaciones fronterizas de los países miembros del Grupo Andino', in CEFIR, *La integración fronteriza y el papel de las regiones en la UE y en el Cono Sur* (Montevideo: CEFIR).

Pelinka, A. (1990) 'Austria', in H.J. Michelmann and P. Soldatos (eds) *Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units* (Oxford: Clarendon Press), pp.132-7.

Rochlin, J. (1995) 'Redefining Mexican "National Security" during an Era of Postsovereignty', *Alternatives*, Vol.20, No.3, pp.369-402.

- Roeder, P. (1991) 'Soviet Federalism and Ethnic Mobilization', *World Politics*, Vol.43, No.1, pp.204-12.
- Rosenau, J.N. (1994) 'New Dimensions of Security: The Interaction of Globalizing and Localizing Dynamics', *Security Dialogue*, Vol.25, No.3, pp.255-81.
- Rumley, D. and J.V. Minghi (eds) (1991) *The Geography of Border Landscapes* (London: Routledge).
- Safran, W. (1994) 'Non-separatist Policies Regarding Ethnic Minorities: Positive Approaches and Ambiguous Consequences', *International Political Science Review*, Vol.15, No.1, pp.61-80
- Schechterman, B.Y. and M. Slamm (eds) (1993) *The Ethnic Dimension in International Relations* (New York: Praeger).
- Schumann, K. (1994): 'The Role of the Council of Europe', in H. Miall (ed.) *Minority Rights in Europe: The Scope for a Transnational Regime* (London: RIIAIPinter), pp.96-7.
- Segal, G. (1992) 'Opening and Dividing China', *The World Today*, Vol.48, No.5, pp.77-80.
- Silva, K.M. and R.J. May (eds) (1991): *Internationalization of Ethnic Conflict* (London: Pinter).
- Silva, K.M. and S.W.R de A. Samarasinghe (eds) (1993) *Peace Accords and Ethnic Conflict* (London: Pinter).
- Smith, P.I. (1993) 'Policy Phases, Subnational Foreign Relations and Constituent Diplomacy in the United States and Canada: City, Provincial, and State Global Activity in British Columbia and Washington', in B. Hocking (ed.) *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London: Leicester University Press).
- Strassoldo, Rand G. Delli Zotti (ed.) (1982) *Co-operation and Conflict in Border Areas* (Milan: Angelli).
- Tannam, E. (1995) 'EU Regional Policy and the Irish/Northern Irish Cross-Border Administrative Relationship', *Regional & Federal Studies*, Vol.5, No.1, pp.67-93.
- Thayer, C.A. (1995) 'Beyond Indochina', *Adelphi Papers*, No.297.
- Thornberry, P. (1991) *International Law and the Rights of*

Minorities (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Thornberry, P. (1994) 'International and European Standards on Minority Rights', in H. Miall (ed.) *Minority Rights in Europe: The Scope for a Transnational Regime* (London: RIIAIPinter). 57

Thorup, L (1993) *Redefining Governance in North America: The Impact of Cross Border Networks and Coalitions on Mexican Immigration into the United States* (Santa Monica: Rand Corporation).

Thual, F. (1994) 'La Chine entre unite et desintegration', *Relations Internationales et Strategiques*, No.15, pp.116-21.

Tokatlian, J.G. and C. Barrera (1991) 'Geograffa, desarrollo regional y polftica exterior: el caso de la frontera tripartita colombo--venezolana-brasileia en la intendencia del Guainia: Una perspectiva desde Colombia', *Estudios Internacionales*, Vol.24, No.93, pp.53-80.

Toledano, E. (1996) 'Le poids des minorites hongroises dans les relations internationales de la Hongrie', *Transitions*, Vol.XXXVII, No.2.

Tomuschat, C. (ed.) (1993) *Modern Law of Self-Determination* (Dordrecht: Martinus Nijhoff).

Trenin, D. (1998) 'Russia and the Emerging Security Environment in Northeast Asia', *Security Dialogue*, Vol.29, No.1, pp.79-88.

Valenciano, E.O. (1995) 'La frontera: un nuevo rol frente a la integración. La experiencia en el Mercosur', in CEFIR, *La integración fronteriza y el papel de las regiones en la UE y en el Cono Sur* (Montevideo: CEFIR).

Watson, A. (1982) *Diplomacy: The Dialogue between States* (London: Methuen).

## The European Union and Inter-regional Co-operation

Assembly of European Regions (1995), *Proposiciones para la revision del Tratado de la Union Europea con ocasion de la Conferencia Intergubernamental de 1996* (Amberes: ARE).

Assembly of European Regions (1996), *Declaration about Regionalism in Europe* (Basilea: ARE).

Balme, R. (1995), 'French Regionalization and European Integration: Territorial Adaptation and Change in a Unitary State', in B. Jones and M. Keating, *The European Union and the Regions* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Balme, R. (1996), *Les politiques du neo-regionalisme* (Paris: Economica).

Banos, J. y A. Iglesias (1995), 'La Politica Regional Europea y la Cooperación Transfronteriza. Los Programas INTERREG', *Revista de Estudios Regionales*, No 42, pp.181-212.

Bolja, A., F. Letarnendia y K. Sodupe (1998), *La Construcción del Espacio Vasco-Aquitano. Un Estudio Multidisciplinar* (Leioa: Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del País Vasco).

Cahmis, M. (1993), 'La Cooperación Transfronteriza e Interregional a nivel Europeo', *EuropaJunta*, No 18, pp.5-10.

Committee of the Regions (1996), 'Dictamen sobre la revisión del Tratado de la Unión Europea y del Tratado constitutivo de la Comunidad Europea', *Official Journal of the European Communities*, OJ C10011 of 2 April.

Committee of the Regions (1997), *Dictamen: La iniciativa comunitaria INTERREG II C y el papel potencial de los entes regionales y locales* (Brussels: Official Publications Office of the European Communities).

Council of Europe (1980), *European Outline Convention on Transfrontier co-operation between territorial communities or authorities* (Madrid).

Council of Europe (1995), *Additional Protocol to the European Outline Convention on Transfrontier Co-operation between Territorial Communities or Authorities* (Strasbourg).

Council of Europe (1998) Protocol n° 2 to the European Outline Convention on Transfrontier Cooperation between Territorial Communities or Authorities concerning interterritorial cooperation (Strasbourg).

Diego J. L. (1997), 'La Cooperaci6n Transfronteriza e Interregional de las Comunidades Aut6nomas', Seminario sobre la Participacion Europea y la Accion Exterior de las Comunidades Autonomas (Barcelona: Institut d'Estudis Autonomies).

European Commission (1994a), Guidelines on Community Initiatives (1994-1999) (Brussels: Official Publications Office of the European Communities).

European Commission (1994b), 'Commission Notice to the Member States. INTERREG II' Official Journal of the European Communities, OJ COM C 180/13 of 15 June.

European Commission (1994c), Regional Development Innovative Measures (art. 10 of ERDF) 1995-1999 (Luxembourg: Official Publications Office of the European Communities).

European Commission (1996a), Structural Funds and Cohesion Funds 1994-1999 (Brussels: Official Publications Office of the European Communities).

European Commission (1996b), 'European Programme for the Inter-regional Co-operation and Regional Economic Innovation. RECITE II. Inter-regional Co-operation Projects', Official Journal of the European Communities, OJ C326 of 31 October.

European Commission (1996c), 'Commission Communication to the Member States. INTERREG II C', Official Journal of the European Communities, OJ COM C 200/07 of 8 May.

European Commission ([ 997), Agenda 2000. For a Stronger and Wider Union. (Brussels: Official Publications Office of the European Communities).

European Commission (1998), 'Proposal for a Council Regulation (EC) Laying down General Provisions of the Structural Funds, Official Journal of the European Communities, OJ 98/C 176/01 of 9 June.

European Parliament (1997), 'Resolution about Transfrontier and Inter-regional Co-operation', A4-0161 of 16 May

(Strasbourg).

Gobierno Vasco (1994), Asociaciones de Cooperacion Inter-regional (Vitoria-Gasteiz: Secretaria General de Acci6n Exterior).

Granrut, C. du (1994), Europe, les temps des Regions (Paris: Librairie Generale du Droit et de la Jurisprudence).

Keating, Michael (1995), 'Europeanism and Regionalism' in B. Jones and M. Keating, The European Union and the Regions (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Keating, M. and J. Loughlin (1997), The Political Economy of Regionalism (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass).

Kukawka, P. (1996), 'Le Quadrige europeen ou l'Europe par les regions', in R. Balme, Les politiques du neo-regionalisme (Paris: Economica).

Labasse, J. (1991), L'Europe des Regions (Paris: Flammarion).

Loughlin, John. (1997), 'L'Europe des Regions et la Federalisation de l'Europe', in J. Palard (dir.) L'Europe aux Frontieres. La cooperation transfrontaliere entre regions d'Espagne et de France (Paris: PUF).

Marks, G. (1992), 'Structural Policy in the European Community', in M. Sbragia, Euro-Politics (Washington: The Brookings Institution) pp.190-224.

Palard, J. (1995), 'Les effets institutionnels de la Politique Regionale de [Union Europeenne', Politiques et Management Publique, Vol. 13, No 3, pp.65-81.

Puyol, R. Y J. Vinuesa (1995), La Union Europea (Madrid: Editorial Sintesis).

Structural Funds (1988), 'Coordination Regulation', Official Journal of the European Communities, OJ L 2052188 24 of August.

Structural Funds (1993), 'ERDF Regulation', Official Journal of the European Communities, OJ 2083/93 20 of July.

Weyand, Sabine (1996), 'Inter-Regional Associations and the European integration Process' in Regional and Federal





## Towards Plurinational Diplomacy in the Deeper and Wider European Union (1985-2005)

Aguirre Zabala, I. (1987) 'Nacionalismo vasco y relaciones transnacionales en el contexto de la frontera hispano-francesa: cuatro modelos historicos', in C. del Arenal (coord.): Las relaciones de vecindad (Bilbao: UPVIEHU).

Aldecoa, F. (1993) 'Eficiencia, eficacia, y democracia: condiciones estructurales para la transformación de la Comunidad Europea en Unión Europea', Sistema, No. 114-15, pp.55-82.

Aldecoa, F. (1998) 'El Tratado de Amsterdam: un pequeño gran paso en la consolidación del modelo de la Unión', Cuadernos Europeos de Deusto, No.18, pp.11-48.

Anderson, M.S. (1993) *The Rise of Modern Diplomacy* (New York: Longman).

Balme, R. (ed.)(1996) *Les politiques du neo-regionalisme* (Paris: Economica).

Barston, R.P. (1988) *Modern Diplomacy* (New York: Longman).

Berridge, G.R. (1995) *Diplomacy: Theory and Practice* (London: Prentice Hall).

Borrás-Alomar, S. T. Christiansen and A. Rodríguez Pose (1994) 'Towards a 'Europe of the Regions'? Visions and Reality from a Critical Perspective', *Regional Politics & Policy*, Vol.4, No.2, pp.I-27.

Brubaker, R. (1996) *Nationalism Reframed: Nationhood and the National Question in the New Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Charpentier, J. and Ch. Engel (dir.)(1992) *Les regions de l'espace communautaire* (Nancy: Presses Universitaires de Nancy).

Dehousse, R. (1991) *Federalisme et relations internationales* (Bruselas: Bruylant).

Duchacek, I.D. (1986) *The Territorial Dimension of Politics: Within, Among, and Across Nations* (Boulder: Westview Press).

Duchacek, J.D., D. Latouche and G. Stevenson (eds)(1988) *Perforated Sovereignities and International Relations: Trans-Sovereign Contacts of Subnational Governments* (New York: Greenwood Press).

Evans, P.B., H.K. Jacobson and R.D. Putnam (eds)(1993) *Double Edged Diplomacy: International Bargaining and Domestic Politics* (Berkeley: University of California Press).

Garda Segura, C. (1995) 'La actividad exterior de las Comunidades Autónomas y la integración europea', *Meridiano Ceri*, No.5, pp.19-22.

Gobierno Vasco/Eusko Jaurlaritz (1996) *Euskadi ante la reforma de la Union Europea: La participación de los pueblos y los ciudadanos de Europa en un proyecto político común* (Vitoria-Gasteiz: Gobierno Vasco/Eusko Jaurlaritz).

Gottlieb, G. (1993) *Nation against State: A New Approach to Ethnic Conflicts and the Decline of Sovereignty* (New York: Council on Foreign Relations).

Hamilton, K. and R. Langhorne (1998) *The Practice of Diplomacy: Its Evolution, Theory and Administration*, (London: Routledge).

Hocking, B. (ed.)(1993a) *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London: Leicester University Press).

Hocking, B. (1993b) *Localizing Foreign Policy: Non Central Governments and Multilayered Diplomacy* (London: Macmillan).

Hocking, B. (1993c) 'Managing Foreign Relations in Federal States: Linking Central and NonCentral International Interests', in B. Hocking (ed.): *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London: Leicester University Press) pp.68-89.

Jones, B. and M. Keating (eds)(1998) *The European Union and the Regions* (Oxford, Oxford University Press).

Keating, M. (1996) *Naciones contra el Estado* (Barcelona: Ariel).

Keating, M. and B. Jones (eds). (1988) *Regions in the European Community* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Keating, M. and J. Loughlin (eds) (1997) *The Political*

Economy of Regionalism (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass).

Kincaid, J. (1993) 'Constituent Diplomacy and the Nation-State: Conflict and Co-operation', in H.J. Michelmann and P. Soldatos (eds): Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units (Oxford: Clarendon Press) pp.54-75.

Le Gales, P. and P. Lequesne (ed.)(1997) Les paradoxes des regions en Europe (Paris: La Decouverte).

Marks, G. and I. Llamazares (1998) 'La transformacion de la movilizacion regional en la Union Europea', Revista de Instituciones Europeas, Vol.22, No.1, pp.149-70.

Michelmann, H.J. and P. Soldatos (eds)(1990) Federalism and International Relations. The Role of Subnational Units (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Perez Gonzalez, M., F. Aldecoa and F. Marino (coord.)(1994) La accion exterior y comunitaria de los Lander, Regiones, Cantones y Comunidades Autonomas (Oñate: IVAPIHAE).

Petschen, S. (1993) La Europa de las Regiones. (Barcelona: Generalitat de Catalunya).

Pueyo, I. and M.T. Ponte (eds)(1997) La actividad exterior y comunitaria de Galicia. La experiencia de otras Comunidades Aut6nomas (Santiago de Compostela: Fundacion Braiias).

Rhodes, M. (ed.)(1998) The Regions in the New Europe: Patterns in Core and Periphery Development (Manchester: Manchester University Press).

Risse Kappen, T. (ed.)(1998) Bringing Transnational Relations Back: Non State Actors, Domestic Structures and International Institutions (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Robbins, K. (1998) 'Britain and Europe: Devolution and Foreign Policy', International Affairs, Vol.78, No.1, pp.105-17.

Skidmore, D. and Y.M. Hudson (ed.)(1993) The Limits of State Autonomy: Societal Groups and Foreign Policy Formulation (Boulder: Westview Press).

Soldatos, P. and H.J. Michelmann (1992) 'Subnational Units' Paradiplomacy in the Context of European Integration', Journal of European Integration, No.1S, pp.129-34.

Ugalde Zubiri, A. (1996) La actuacion internacional del Gobierno Vasco en el exilio 1940-1960: un caso singular de accion exterior, unpublished research.

Watson, A. (1982) Diplomacy: The Dialogue Between States (London: Methuen).

# The Other Dimension of Third Level Politics in Europe: The Congress of Local and Regional Powers of the Council of Europe

Albanese, F. (1994), 'El proceso de descentralización del Consejo de Europa' in Revista Vasca de Administracion Publica, No.40 (II).

Balme, R (1996), 'Pourquoi le gouvernement change-t-il d'echelle?' in R Balme (Dir.), Les Politiques du neo-regionalisme (Paris: Economica).

Beltran Garcia, S. and J.L. Piiiol i Rull (1997), 'La contribución de la Asamblea de las Regiones de Europa (ARE) al desarrollo de las acciones internacionales de las Comunidades Autónomas', in Informe Pi i Sunyer sobre Comunidades Autonomas 1995-1996 (Barcelona: Fundació Carles Pi i Sunyer d'Estudis Autonòmics i Locals).

Benoit-Rohmer, F. (1996), La question minoritaire en Europe. Vers un systeme coherent de protection des minorites nationales (Strasbourg: Editions du Conseil de l'Europe).

Bullman, U. (1996), 'The Politics of the Third Level', Regional and Federal Studies, Vol.6, No.2.

Camilleri, J.A. and I. Falk (1992), The End of Sovereignty: The Politics of a Shrinking and Fragmenting World (Aldershot: Edward Elgar).

Castro Ruano, J.L. de (1994), La emergente participacion politicade las Regiones en el proceso de construccion europea (Oñati: Instituto Vasco de Administraci6n).

Castro Ruano, J.L. de, A. B0Ija, et al. (eds) (1994), Cooperacion transfronteriza EuskadiAquitania: Aspectos politicos, economicos, y de Relaciones Intemacionales (Leioa: Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del Pais Vasco).

Clotet i Miro, M.A. (1992), La cooperacion internacional de los municipios en el marco del Consejo de Europa. La obra de la Conferencia Permanente de Poderes Locales y Regionales de Europa (Madrid: Civitas).

Diego Casals, J.L. (1994), 'El proyecto de convención sobre la Cooperación Interterritorial' in Cursos de Derecho Internacional de Vitoria-Gasteiz, 1993 (Madrid:

Tecnosl Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del Pais Vasco).

Fenel. A. (Dteur.) (1995), *Le droit et les minorites* (Bruxelles: Etablissements Emile Bruylant).

Ferguson, Y.H. and RW. Mansbach (1992), 'The Subject is Politics', Paneuropean Conference on International Relations, Heidelberg.

Fernandez de Casadevante, C. (1985), *La frontera hispanofrancesa y las relaciones de vecindad* (Leioa: Servicio Editorial de la Universidad del Pais Vasco).

Fernandez de Casadevante, C. (1990), *La cooperacion Transfronteriza en el Pirineo: su gestion por las Comunidades Autonomas* (Oiiati: Instituto Vasco de Administraci6n PUblica).

Garcia Segura, C. (1996), 'La actividad exterior de las entidades politicas subestatales', *Revista de Estudios Politicos*, No.9!

Grau Tanner, C. (1997), *La representacion institucional de los entes locales ante los organismos europeos*, in *La posicion institucional de la Administracion Local en el S.XXI*, a course directed by Demetrio Loperena in Summer Courses in Donostia-San Sebastian (paper provided by the author).

Hocking, B. (1996), 'Bridging Boundaries: Creating Linkages. Non-central Governments and Multilayered Policy Environments', *Welt Trends*, No.1!

Jauregui, G. (1997), *Los nacionalismos minoritarios y la Union Europea* (Barcelona: Ariel).

Jeffery C. (1996), 'Sub-National Authorities and "European Domestic Policy" in *Regional & Federal Studies*, Vol.6, No.2 (special issue C. Jeffery, ed., *The Regional Dimension of the European Union: Towards a Third Level in Europe?*)

Keating, M. (1997) 'Les regions constituent-elles un niveau de gouvernement en Europe?' in P. Le Gales and C. Lequesne, *Les paradoxes des regions en Europe* (Paris: Editions La Decouverte).

Kramer, R. (1995) 'Catching Up or Setting Up a New Agenda? East German Uinder International Involvement: The Case of Brandenburg', in *Second Pan-European Conference on*

International Relations, Paris.

Levrat, N. (1994) *Le droit applicable aux accords de cooperation transfrontiere entre collectivites infraetatiques* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France).

Levrat, N. (1997) 'Assessment and perspectives of regionalism and regionalisation in Europe' in *Assembly Of European Regions, The Regions in the construction of Europe. Proceedings of the Seminar organized by the ARE aln Alsace Regional Council. 22nd may 1996.*

Loughlin, J. (1996) 'Representing Regions in Europe: The Committee of The Regions' in *Regional and Federal Studies*, Vol. 6, no. 2,

Palard, J. (Dteur) (1997) *L'Europe auxfrontieres* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France).

Perez Gonzalez, M. (1995) 'La cooperation interrregional et sa possible couverture conventionnelle' in *AA:VV; Le droit applique a la cooperation interregionale en Europe* (Paris: Librairie Generale de Droit et de Jurisprudence).

Roseanu, J,N. and Durke, M.(J995) *Thinking Theory Thoroughly, Coherent Approaches to an Incoherent World* (Boulder: Westview Press).

# The International Competence of US States and their Local Governments

Avery, William P. (1998), 'Domestic Interests in NAFrA Bargaining', *Political Science Quarterly*, Vol. 113, No.2, pp.281-305.

Beckman, Norman (1991), 'The Governors and the National Guard in *Perpich v. Defense*', *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, Vol.21, No.3, pp.109-24. 133

Buchanan, Patrick I. (1998), *The Great Betrayal: How American Sovereignty and Social Justice Are Being Sacrificed to the Gods of the Global Economy*, Boston: Little, Brown.

Chandler, Clay (1998), 'The Best of Times, the Worst of Times', *The Washington Post National Weekly Edition*, 24 August, p.20.

*Cherokee Nation v. Georgia* (1831), 30 US I.

*Clark v. Allen* (1947), 331 US 503.

Conway, Carol (1998), 'Southerners Need More Trade Information', *Southern Growth Update*, Vol.23, No.4, p.7.

Fry, Earl H. (1998), 'The Expanding Role of State and Local Governments in US Foreign Relations'. Paper presented at Annual Meeting of American Political Science Association, Boston, Massachusetts, 3 September.

Henkin, Louis (1972), *Foreign Affairs and the Constitution* (Mineola, NY: Foundation Press, 1972).

Kincaid, John (1984), 'The American Governors in International Affairs', *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, Vol.14, No.4, pp.95-114.

Kincaid, John (1989), 'Rain Clouds Over Municipal Diplomacy: Dimensions and Possible Sources of Negative Public Opinion', in Earl H. Fry, Lee H. Radebaugh and Panayotis Soldatos (eds), *The New International Cities Era: The Global Activities of North American Municipal Governments* (Provo, UT: David M. Kennedy Center for International Affairs, Brigham Young University), pp.223--49.

Kincaid, John with Joshua L. Handelsman (1997), *American Cities in the Global Economy: A Survey of Municipalities*



on Activities and Attitudes (Washington, DC: National League of Cities).

Kline, John M. (1983), *State Government Influence in US International Economic Policy* (Lexington, MA: Lexington Books).

Lutz, Donald S. (1988), 'The United States Constitution as an Incomplete Text', *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol.496, pp.23-32.

Manning, Bayless (1977), 'The Congress, the Executive and Interrnestic Affairs: Three Proposals', *Foreign Affairs*, Vol.55, No.1, pp.306--24.

Nothdurft, William E. and Ilene K. Grossman (1996), *Small Firm Export Assistance in Europe: Lessons for States* (Lombard, IL: Council of State Governments, Midwestern Office).

Palumbo, Dennis J. (1969), 'The States and the Conduct of Foreign Relations', in Daniel J. Elazar (ed.), *Cooperation and Conflict: Readings in American Federalism* (Itasca, IL: FE Peacock).

*Perpich v. Department of Defense* (1990), 496 US 334.

Public Citizen (1998), Web Site:  
[www.citizen.org/pctrade/FastTrack/poll.html](http://www.citizen.org/pctrade/FastTrack/poll.html).

Putnam, Robert D. (1988), 'Diplomacy and Domestic Politics: The Logic of Two-Level Games', *International Organization*, Vol.42, No.2, pp.427-60.

Sarpolus, Ed (1998), 'The WIITIEPIC-MRA Survey of Public Opinion on International Trade', *Clearinghouse on State International Policies*, Vol.1.8, No.6, p.5.

*United States v. Curtiss-Wright Export Corporation* (1936), 299 US 304.

US Advisory Commission on Intergovernmental Relations (1993), *The National Guard: Defending the Nation and the States* (Washington, DC: ACIR).

US General Accounting Office (1998), *International Affairs Activities of Domestic Agencies*, Washington, DC.

Wechsler, Herbert (1954), 'The Political Safeguards of Federalism: The Role of the States in the Composition and

Selection of the National Government', Columbia Law Review, Vol.54, No.2, pp.543-67.

Weiler, Conrad (1994), 'Foreign-Trade Agreements: A New Federal Partner?' Publius: The Journal of Federalism Vol.24, No.3, pp.113-33.

Zschernig v. Miller (1968), 389 US 429, 441.

## Federal-State Relations in Australian External Affairs: A New Co-operative Era?

Commonwealth of Australia, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Japan Secretariat (1981) 'The Commonwealth-State Relationship: Its relevance to Australia's Relations with Japan'. Canberra: Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Research Paper CCRJ/25/8 I, October.

Commonwealth of Australia, Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet (1996) 'Trans-Tasman Mutual Recognition Arrangement.' [<http://www.nla.gov.au/pmc/trans.htmlj>].

Harris, Stuart (1993) 'Federalism and Australian Foreign Policy' in Brian Hocking (ed.), *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London: Leicester University Press), pp.90-103.

Hocking, Brian (1984) 'Pluralism and Foreign Policy: The States and the Management of Australia's External Relations', *Yearbook of World Affairs*, London.

Ravenhill, John (1990) 'Australia' in Hans J. Michelmann and Panyotis Soldatos (eds), *Federated States in International Relations* (Oxford: Oxford University Press), pp.76-123.

Taylor, W. (1996) 'Trick or Treaty: An Australian Perspective.' [<http://www.aph.gov.au/house/committees/jsct11ISPEECH.HTMj>].

## The Quebec Experience: Success or Failure?

Balthazar, Louis (1993a) 'Quebec's International Relations: A Response to Needs and Necessities', in Brian Hocking (ed.) *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London and New York: Leicester University Press) pp.140-52.

Balthazar, Louis (1993b) 'Les relations Quebec-Etats-Unis', in L. Balthazar et al., *Trente ans de politique exterieure 1960-1990* (Sillery, QC: Les Editions du Septentrion), pp.65-105.

Balthazar, Louis (1992) 'The Other Side of Canada-U.S. Relations', in John English and Norman Hillmer (eds), *Making A Difference? Canada's Foreign Policy in A Changing World Order* (Toronto: Lester Publishing Ltd), pp.15-33.

Belanger, Louis (1997) 'Les enjeux actuels de la participation du Quebec it la francophonie multilaterale: de la paradiplomatie it la protodiplomatie', *Politique et societe* (Societe quebecoise de science politique, Montreal), Vol.16, No.1.

Bell, David V.1. (1992) *The Roots of Disunity, A Study of Canadian Political Culture* (Toronto: Oxford University Press).

Bernier, Luc (1996) *De Paris a Washington. La Politique Internationale du Quebec* (Quebec: Les Presses de l'Universite du Quebec).

Cairns, Alan (1991) *Disruptions: Constitutional Struggles from the Charter to Meech Lake* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart).

Government of Canada (1995) *Canada in the World: Government Statement* (Canada Communication Group-Publishing, Public Works and Government Services, Ottawa).

Hocking, Brian (1994) 'Les interets internationaux des gouvernements regionaux: desuetude de l'interne et de l'externe', *Etudes internationales* (numero special sur Les politiques exterieures des Etats non souverains sous la direction de Ivan Bernier), Vol.xxv No.3, pp.409-20.

Hocking, Brian (1997) 'Regionalism: An International Relations Perspective', in Michael Keating and John Loughlin (eds), *The Political Economy of Regionalism* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass).

Mace, Gordon et al. (1996) 'Canadian Foreign Policy and Quebec', in Maxwell Cameron and Maureen A. Molot, *Canada Among Nations 1995: Democracy and Foreign Policy* (Ottawa: Carleton University Press).

Mahant, Edelgard and Graeme Mount (1989) *An Introduction to Canadian-American Relations*, 2nd edition (Toronto: Nelson Canada).

Morin, Jacques-Yvan et al. (1992) *Droit international public: Notes et Documents, tome 11: Documents d'interet canadien et quebecois* (Montreal: Editions Themis).

# The International Relations of Basque Nationalism and the First Basque Autonomous Government (1890-1939)

Aguirre, Iñaki (1987) 'Nacionalismo vasco y relaciones transnacionales en el contexto de la frontera hispano-francesa: cuatro modelos históricos', in C. del Arenal (ed.), *Las relaciones de vecindad* (Bilbao: Universidad del País Vasco), pp.73-101.

Apalategi, Jokin (1977) *Nationalisme et question nationale au Pays Basque 1830-1976* (Bayonne: Elkar).

Apalategi, Jokin (1985) *Los vascos, de la autonomía a la independencia. Formación y desarrollo del concepto de la nación vasca* (San Sebastián-Donostia: Txertoa).

Arenal, Celestino del (1990) *Introducción a las relaciones internacionales* (Madrid: Tecnos, 3rd edition).

Azcona, Jesús (1984) *Etnia y nacionalismo vasco: una aproximación desde la antropología* (Barcelona: Antrophos).

Beobide, Ignacio Marfa (1993) 'Nacionalismo vasco: nación y poder', *Estudios de Deusto*, Vol.41, No.1, pp.9-98.

Beramendi, Justo G., Ramón Maiz and Xosé M Nunez (eds) (1994) *Nationalism in Europe. Past and Present* (Santiago de Compostela: Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, 2 volumes).

Camino, Inigo and Luis de Gueza (1991) *Juventud y nacionalismo vasco. Bilbao (1901-1937)* (Bilbao: Fundación Sabino Arana).

Chazan, Naomi (ed.) (1991) *Irredentism and International Relations* (Boulder: Lynne Rienner).

Chueca, Iosu (1996) *El nacionalismo vasco en Navarra durante la II República* (Doctoral Thesis, Universidad del País Vasco/Euskai Herriko Unibertsitatea).

Conversi, Daniele (1993) 'Domino Effect or Internal Developments? The Influences of International Events and Political Ideologies on Catalan and Basque Nationalism', *West European Politics*, Vol.6, No.3, pp.245-70.

Conversi, Daniele (1997) *The Basques, the Catalans and Spain* (London: Hurst & Company).

Corcuera, Javier (1979) Orígenes, ideología y organización del nacionalismo vasco (1876-1904) (Madrid: Siglo XXI).

Corcuera, Javier, Oribe, Yolanda and Alday, Jesús María (1991) Historia del nacionalismo vasco en sus documentos (Bilbao: Eguzki, 4 volumes).

Cornago, Nne (1996) Acción exterior y paradiplomacia: la proyección internacional de los mesogobiernos (Doctoral Thesis, Universidad del País Vasco/Euskal Herriko Unibertsitatea).

Douglass, William A. (ed.) (1985) Basque Politics: A case study in Ethnic Nationalism (Reno: University of Nevada).

Duchacek, Ivo D. (1986) The Territorial Dimension of Politics: Within, Among and Across Nations (London: Westview Press).

Duchacek, Ivo D. (1990) 'Perforated Sovereignities: Towards a Typology of New Actors in International Relations', in H.J. Michelmann and P. Soldatos (eds), Federalism and International Relations. The Role of the Subnational Units (Oxford: Clarendon Press), pp.1-23.

Duchacek, Ivo D., Daniel Latouche and Garth Stevenson (eds) (1988) Perforated Sovereignities and International Relations. Trans-Sovereign Contacts of Subnational Governments (New York, Greenwood Press).

Elorza, Antonio (1978) Ideologías del nacionalismo vasco, 1876-1936 (San Sebastián-Donostia: Haranburu).

Elorza, Antonio (1981) Nacionalismo vasco, 1876-1936 (temas) (San Sebastián-Donostia: Haranburu).

Esman, Milton J. (1990) 'Ethnic Pluralism and International Relations', Canadian Review of Studies in Nationalism, Vol.XVIII, No.1-2, pp.83-93

Esman, Milton J. (1995) 'Ethnic Actors in International Politics', Nationalism and Ethnic Politics, YoU, No.1, pp.111-125.

Esman, Milton J. and Shibley Telhami (eds) (1995) International Organizations and Ethnic Conflict (Ithaca: Cornell University Press).

Estevez, Xosé (1991) De la Triple Alianza al Pacto de San Sebastián (1923-1930). Antecedentes del Galeuzca (San

Sebastian-Donostia: EVTG-Mundaiz).

Estevez, Xose (1992) 'El nacionalismo vasco y los Congresos de Minoras Nacionales de la Sociedad de Naciones (1916--1936)' by several authors XI Congreso de Estudios Vascos (San Sebastian-Donostia: Sociedad de Estudios Vascos), pp.311-22.

Garcia de Cortazar, Fernando and Jose Manuel Azcona (1991) El nacionalismo vasco (Madrid: Historia 16).

Garcia, Caterina (1993) 'La evoluci6n del concepto de actor en la teora de las relaciones internacionales', Papers, No.41, pp.13-31.

Granja, Jose Luis de la (1986) Nacionalismo y II Republica en el Pais Vasco: Estatutos de Autonomia, partidos y elecciones. Historia de Accion Nacionalista Vasca, 1930-1936 (Madrid: Siglo XXI).

Granja, Jose Luis de la (1989) 'La alianza de los nacionalismos perifericos en la II Republica: Galeuzca', in J.G. Beramendi and R. Villares (eds), Actas Congreso Caste/ao (Santiago de Compostela: Universidad de Santiago de Compostela), YoU, pp.321-47.

Granja, Jose Luis (1990) Republica y Guerra Civil en Euskadi (Onati: IVAP).

Granja, Jose Luis de la (1991) BibliograJfa de Historia Contemporanea del Pais Vasco (VitoriaGasteiz: Eusko Bibliographia).

Granja, Jose Luis de la (1994) 'La historia del nacionalismo vasco en la bibliografia mas reciente', Notas (Frankfurt), No.2, pp.2-12.

Granja, Jose Luis de la (1995) El nacionalismo vasco: un siglo de historia (Madrid: Tecnos).

Heiberg, Marianne (1989) The Making of the Basque Nation (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Heraklides, A. (1990) The Self-Determination of Minorities in International Politics (Londonand Portland, OR: Frank Cass).

Larronde, Jean-Claude (1972) Le nationalisme basque. Son origine et son ideologie dans la vie et ['oeuvre de Sabino Arana Goiri (Bordeaux: Universite de Bordeaux).



- Larronde, Jean-Claude (1977) El nacionalismo vasco: su origen y su ideología en la obra de Sabino Arana Goiri (San Sebastián-Donostia: Txertoa).
- Letamendia, Pierre (1987) Nationalismes au Pays Basque (Bordeaux: Presses Universitaires de Bordeaux).
- López Adán, Emilio 'Beltza' (1976) El nacionalismo vasco, 1876-1936 (San Sebastián-Donostia: Txertoa).
- Lorenzo, Jose Maria (1992) 'Influencia del nacionalismo irlandés en el nacionalismo vasco, 1916-1936', by several authors XI Congreso de Estudios Vascos (San Sebastián-Donostia: Sociedad de Estudios Vascos), pp.239-47.
- Martinez, Araceli (1989) Antecedentes y primeros pasos del nacionalismo vasco en Navarra, 1878-1918 (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra).
- Mayall, James (1990) Nationalism and International Society (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Meer, Fernando de (1992) El PNV ante la Guerra de España (1936-1937) (Pamplona: Universidad de Navarra).
- Mees, Ludger (1991) Entre nación y clase. El nacionalismo vasco y su base social en perspectiva comparativa (Bilbao: Fundación Sabino Arana).
- Mees, Ludger (1992) Nacionalismo vasco, movimiento obrero y cuestión social (1903-1923) (Bilbao: Fundación Sabino Arana).
- Merle, Marcel (1988) Sociologie des relations internationales (Paris: Dalloz, 4th edition).
- Moynihan, Daniel Patrick (1993) Pandemonium: Ethnicity and International Conflicts (New York, Oxford University Press).
- Núñez, Xosé Manoel (1992a) El problema de las nacionalidades en la Europa de entreguerras. El Congreso de Nacionalidades Europeas (1925-1938), Doctoral Thesis, European University Institute of Florence, see also a summary in (1994) Bulletin d'Histoire Contemporaine de l'Espagne (Bordeaux), No.19, pp.122-7.
- Núñez, Xosé Manoel (1992b) 'El mito del nacionalismo

irlandes y su influencia en los nacionalismos gallego, vasco y catalan (1880-1936)', Spagna Contemporanea (Torino), No.2, pp.25-58.

Nunez, Xose Manoel (1995a) 'Relaciones exteriores del nacionalismo vasco (1895-1960)', in S. De Pablo (ed.), Los nacionalistas. Historia del nacionalismo vasco, 1876-1960 (VitoriaGasteiz: Fundaci6n Sancho el Sabio), pp.381-417.

Nunez, Xose Manoel (1995b) 'Protodiplomacia exterior 0 ilusiones 6pticas? EI nacionalismo vasco, el contexto internacional y el Congreso de Nacionalidades Europeas (1914-1937)" Cuadernos de Seccion. Historia-Geograffa. Sociedad de Estudios Vascos, No.23, pp.243-75.

Nunez, Xose Manoel (1996) 'Minorfas nacionales y relaciones internacionales en las historiograffas anglosajona y centroeuropea: algunas reflexiones' (Communication at the I Congress of History of the International Relations, Madrid, 1994) in La historia de las Relaciones Internacionales: una vision desde Espana (Madrid: Comisi6n Espanola de Historia de las Relaciones Internacionales), pp.315-52.

Pablo, Santiago de (1988) EI nacionalismo vasco en Alava (1907-1936) (Bilbao: Ekin).

Pablo, Santiago de (ed.) (1995) Los nacionalistas. Historia del nacionalismo vasco, 1876-1960 (Vitoria-Gasteiz: Fundaci6n Sancho el Sabio).

Pablo, Santiago de, Jose Luis de la Granja and Ludger Mees, (eds) (1998) Documentos para la historia del nacionalismo vasco. De los Fueros a nuestros dfas (Barcelona: Ariel).

Payne, Stanley G. (1974) Basque nationalism (Reno: University of Nevada Press).

Ryan, Stephen (1995) Ethnic Conflict and International Relations (Aldershot: Dartmouth Publishing, 2nd edition).

San Sebastian, Koldo (1984) Historia del Partido Nacionalista Vasco (San Sebastian-Donostia: Txertoa).

San Sebastian, Koldo (ed.) (1991) The Basque Archives. Vascos en Estados Unidos (1938-1943) (San Sebastian-Donostia: Txertoa).

Schechtennan, Bernard and Martin Slann (eds) (1993) The

Ethnic Dimension in International Relations (New York: Praeger).

Smith, Paul (ed.) (1991) Ethnic Groups in International Relations (New York: New York University Press).

Solozabal, Juan Jose (1975) El primer nacionalismo vasco: industrialismo y conciencia nacional (Madrid: Tucar).

Truyol, Antonio (1987) La Sociedad Internacional (Madrid: Alianza, 6th edition).

Ugalde, Alexander (1994) 'Nacionalismo vasco y europeismo', Muga (Bilbao), No.89, pp.6-11.

Ugalde, Alexander (1995a) 'La acción exterior del nacionalismo vasco (1890--1939): historia, pensamiento y relaciones internacionales', Bulletin d'Histoire Contemporaine de l'Espagne (Bordeaux), No.21, pp.122-9.

Ugalde, Alexander (1995b) 'Acercamiento a los vínculos pasados y presentes vasco-africanos (conclusiones de una investigación)', Estudios Africanos (Madrid), Vol.9, No.16-17, pp.77-91.

Ugalde, Alexander (1996a) 'La actuación internacional del primer Gobierno Vasco durante la Guerra Civil (1936-39)' Sancho el Sabio (Vitoria-Gasteiz), No.6, pp.187-210.

Ugalde, Alexander (1996b) La acción exterior del nacionalismo vasco (1890-1939): historia, pensamiento y relaciones internacionales (Oñati: Instituto Vasco de Administración Pública).

Ugalde, Alexander (1997a) 'Entrada del nacionalismo vasco en el Congreso de Nacionalidades Europeas, 1929-1930 (siguiendo la documentación del Fondo Apraiz)' Revista Internacional de Estudios Vascos (San Sebastián-Donostia), No.42, No.2, pp.03-21.

Ugalde, Alexander (1997b) 'Les relations internationales du nationalisme basque depuis son apparition jusqu' a la Guerre Civile espagnole (1890--1939)' Lapurdum (Bayonne), No.2, pp.359--65.

Ugalde, Mercedes (1993) Mujeres y nacionalismo vasco. Genesis y desarrollo de Emakume Abertzale Batza (1906-1936) (Bilbao: Universidad del País Vasco).

Waldmann, Peter (1990) Militanter Nationalismus im

Baskeland (Frankfurt am Main: Vervuert).

Zabalo, Julen (1996) Euskal nazionalismoa eta nazio lurraldea (Bilbao: Udako Euskal Unibertsitatea).

Zorgbibe, Charles (1982) Sur l'etat de la Societe Internationale (Paris).

# Making Sense of Paradiplomacy? An Intertextual Inquiry about a Concept in Search of a Definition

Der Derian, James (1987) *On Diplomacy: A Genealogy of Western Estrangement* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell).

Der Derian, James (1992) *Antidiplomacy: Spies, Terror, Speed and War* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell).

Der Derian, James (1995) *International Theory: Critical Investigations* (Basingstoke and London, Macmillan).

Der Derian, James and Michael Shapiro (eds) (1989) *International/Intertextual Relations: Postmodern Readings of World Politics* (Lexington, MA: Lexington Books).

Duchacek, Ivo D. (1986a) *The Territorial Dimension of Politics: Within, Among, and Across Nations* (Boulder and London: Westview Press).

Duchacek, Ivo D. (1986b) 'International Competence of Subnational Governments: Borderlines and Beyond' in Oscar J. Martinez (ed.), *Across Boundaries: Transborder Interaction in Comparative Perspective* (The University of Texas at El Paso: Texas Western Press).

Duchacek, Ivo D. (1988) 'Multicommunal and Bicomunal Polities and Their International Relations', in Ivo D. Duchacek, Daniel Latouche and Garth Stevenson (eds), *Perforated Sovereignties and International Relations: Trans-Sovereign Contacts of Subnational Governments* (New York and London: Greenwood Press). 209

Duchacek, Ivo D. (1990) 'Perforated Sovereignties: Toward a Typology of New Actors in International Relations', in Hans J. Michelmann and Panayotis Soldatos (eds), *Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Dyment, David K.M. (1993) 'Substate Paradiplomacy: The Case of the Ontario Government' in Brian Hocking (ed.), *Localizing Foreign Policy: Non-Central Governments and Mutilayered Diplomacy* (New York: St. Martin's Press).

Hocking, Brian (1993a) *Foreign Relations and Federal States* (London and New York: Leicester University Press).

Hocking, Brian (1993b) *Localizing Foreign Policy: Non-Central Governments and Mutilayered Diplomacy* (London

and New York: Macmillan and St Martin's Press).

Hocking, Brian (1994) 'Les interets internationaux des gouvernements regionaux: desuetude de l'interne et de l'externe?', *Revue Etudes Internationales*, VoI.XXV, 4.3.

Hocking, Brian (1996) 'Bridging Boundaries: Creating Linkages: Non-Central Governments and Multilayered Policy Environments', *Welt Trends*, n.11.

Jellinek, Georg (1896) *Ober Staatsfragmente* (Heidelberg: Verlag von Gustav Koester).

Kincaid, John (1990) 'Constituent Diplomacy in Federal Politics and the Nation State: Conflict And Cooperation' in Hans J. Michelmann and Panayotis Soldatos (eds), *Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units* (New York: Oxford University Press).

Michelman, Hans J. and Panayotis Soldatos (eds) (1990) *Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units* (New York: Oxford University Press).

Philip, Christian and Panayotis Soldatos (eds) (1996) *Au-dela et endec;a de l'Etat-nation* (Bruxelles: Bruylant).

Smith, Patrick J. (1993) 'Policy Phases, Subnational Foreign Relations and Constituent Diplomacy in the United States and Canada: City, Provincial and State Global Activity in British Columbia and Washington', in Brian Hocking (ed.), *Localizing Foreign Policy: NonCentral Governments and Mutilayered Diplomacy* (London and New York: Macmillan and St Martin's Press).

Soldatos, Panayotis (1990) 'An Explanatory Framework for the Study of Federated States as Foreign-policy Actors', in Hans J. Michelmann and Panayotis Soldatos (eds), *Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Walker, R.B.J. (1993) *Inside/Outside: International Relations as Political Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).